

# **Exhibit B**

**EX. B to Agyeman**  
*(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)*

	DECEDENT First Name	DECEDENT Middle Name	DECEDENT Last Name	Suffix Name	Economic Damage Amount	Non-Economic Damage Amount	TOTAL Damage Amount
1.	Shabbir		Ahmed			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
2.	Jacquelyn	D.	Aldridge		\$866,223	\$2,000,000	\$2,866,223
3.	Richard	L.	Allen		\$1,042,427	\$2,000,000	\$3,042,427
4.	Janet		Alonso		\$4,370,828	\$2,000,000	\$6,370,828
5.	Joseph		Amatuccio		\$5,016,125	\$2,000,000	\$7,016,125
6.	Carl		Asaro		\$2,719,191	\$2,000,000	\$4,719,191
7.	James		Audiffred		\$2,212,310	\$2,000,000	\$4,212,310
8.	Robert	J.	Baierwalter		\$2,692,685	\$2,000,000	\$4,692,685
9.	Matthew		Barnes		\$4,850,778	\$2,000,000	\$6,850,778
10.	Shelia	P.	Barnes		\$535,215	\$2,000,000	\$2,535,215
11.	Michael	A.	Boccardi		\$4,291,363	\$2,000,000	\$6,291,363
12.	Donna		Bowen		\$1,270,558	\$2,000,000	\$3,270,558
13.	Veronique	N.	Bowers		\$3,203,673	\$2,000,000	\$5,203,673
14.	Daniel	M.	Caballero		\$1,404,867	\$2,000,000	\$3,404,867
15.	Brian		Cachia		\$2,416,320	\$2,000,000	\$4,416,320
16.	Felix		Calixte			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
17.	James		Carson	Jr.	\$3,836,021	\$2,000,000	\$5,836,021
18.	John		Chada		\$516,276	\$2,000,000	\$2,516,276
19.	Vernon	P.	Cherry			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
20.	Benjamin	K.	Clark		\$2,279,881	\$2,000,000	\$4,279,881
21.	Donna		Clarke		\$1,050,041	\$2,000,000	\$3,050,041
22.	Geoffrey		Cloud		\$10,692,768	\$2,000,000	\$12,692,768
23.	Florence		Cohen		\$78,787	\$2,000,000	\$2,078,787
24.	Brenda	E.	Conway		\$1,960,919	\$2,000,000	\$3,960,919
25.	Alejandro		Cordero		\$822,198	\$2,000,000	\$2,822,198
26.	Digna		Costanza		\$1,935,156	\$2,000,000	\$3,935,156
27.	James	R.	Coyle		\$2,526,682	\$2,000,000	\$4,526,682
28.	Kenneth	J.	Cubas		\$2,240,468	\$2,000,000	\$4,240,468
29.	Gerald	F.	DeConto		\$2,108,676	\$2,000,000	\$4,108,676
30.	Lawrence		Davidson		\$684,597	\$2,000,000	\$2,684,597

TOTALS

\$67,625,033

\$60,000,000

**\$127,625,033**

# **Exhibit B-1**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. John Chada**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 14, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.4%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. JOHN CHADA**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$236,961
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	279,315
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$516,276</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
34,298	3.0%	11.010%	2,400	26.675%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. JOHN CHADA**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	56	0.31	1.00000	\$10,517	\$736	\$0	(\$1,158)	(\$2,497)	\$7,599	\$7,599
2002	57	1.31	1.03000	35,326	2,496	(1,010)	(3,773)	(8,134)	24,906	24,906
2003	58	2.31	1.03000	36,386	2,572	(1,040)	(3,886)	(8,378)	25,654	25,654
2004	59	3.31	1.03000	37,478	2,648	(1,071)	(4,003)	(8,630)	26,423	26,423
2005	60	4.31	1.03000	38,602	2,728	(1,103)	(4,123)	(8,888)	27,216	27,216
2006	61	5.31	1.03000	39,760	2,810	(1,136)	(4,246)	(9,155)	28,032	28,032
2007	62	6.31	1.03000	40,953	2,895	(1,171)	(4,374)	(9,430)	28,874	28,874
2008	63	7.31	1.03000	42,182	2,981	(1,206)	(4,505)	(9,713)	29,739	29,739
2009	64	8.31	1.03000	43,447	3,071	(1,242)	(4,640)	(10,004)	30,632	30,632
2010	65	8.56	1.03000	11,188	791	(320)	(1,195)	(2,576)	7,888	7,888
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$335,840</b>	<b>\$23,727</b>	<b>(\$9,299)</b>	<b>(\$35,901)</b>	<b>(\$77,405)</b>	<b>\$236,961</b>	<b>\$236,961</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	26.675%	4.370%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS****MR. JOHN CHADA**

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIB.	ARMY PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	56	0.31	\$460	\$4,438	(\$959)	(\$1,051)	\$2,888	\$2,888
2002	57	1.31	1,497	15,520	(3,676)	(3,559)	9,783	9,783
2003	58	2.31	1,542	15,830	(3,752)	(3,633)	9,987	9,987
2004	59	3.31	1,589	16,147	(3,831)	(3,709)	10,196	10,196
2005	60	4.31	1,636	16,470	(3,911)	(3,787)	10,409	10,409
2006	61	5.31	1,685	16,799	(3,993)	(3,866)	10,626	10,626
2007	62	6.31	1,736	17,135	(4,076)	(3,947)	10,848	10,848
2008	63	7.31	1,788	17,478	(4,161)	(4,029)	11,075	11,075
2009	64	8.31	1,842	17,828	(4,249)	(4,114)	11,307	11,307
2010	65	9.31	474	18,185	(4,030)	(3,902)	10,727	10,727
2011	66	10.31	0	18,549	(4,007)	(3,879)	10,663	10,663
2012	67	11.31	0	18,920	(4,087)	(3,957)	10,877	10,877
2013	68	12.31	0	19,298	(4,168)	(4,036)	11,094	11,094
2014	69	13.31	0	19,684	(4,252)	(4,117)	11,316	11,316
2015	70	14.31	0	20,078	(4,337)	(4,199)	11,542	11,542
2016	71	15.31	0	20,480	(4,424)	(4,283)	11,773	11,773
2017	72	16.31	0	20,890	(4,512)	(4,369)	12,009	12,009
2018	73	17.31	0	21,308	(4,603)	(4,456)	12,249	12,249
2019	74	18.31	0	21,734	(4,695)	(4,545)	12,494	12,494
2020	75	19.31	0	22,169	(4,789)	(4,636)	12,744	12,516
2021	76	20.31	0	22,612	(4,884)	(4,729)	12,999	12,346
2022	77	21.31	0	23,064	(4,982)	(4,823)	13,259	12,179
2023	78	22.31	0	23,525	(5,081)	(4,920)	13,524	12,014
2024	79	23.31	0	23,996	(5,183)	(5,018)	13,795	11,852
2025	80	24.31	0	24,476	(5,287)	(5,119)	14,070	11,691
2026	81	24.72	0	10,402	(2,247)	(2,175)	5,980	4,852
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$14,250</b>	<b>\$487,015</b>	<b>(\$108,174)</b>	<b>(\$104,856)</b>	<b>\$288,234</b>	<b>\$279,315</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. JOHN CHADA**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	56	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	57	1.31			0	0
2003	58	2.31			0	0
2004	59	3.31			0	0
2005	60	4.31			0	0
2006	61	5.31			0	0
2007	62	6.31			0	0
2008	63	7.31			0	0
2009	64	8.31			0	0
2010	65	9.31			0	0
2011	66	10.31			0	0
2012	67	11.31			0	0
2013	68	12.31			0	0
2014	69	13.31			0	0
2015	70	14.31			0	0
2016	71	15.31			0	0
2017	72	16.31			0	0
2018	73	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-2**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Donna Bowen**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **July 25, 2002**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. DONNA BOWEN**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,216,252
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	54,306
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,270,558</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
59,366	3.0%	15.480%	2,400	7.520%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. DONNA BOWEN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	43	0.31	1.00000	\$18,204	\$736	\$0	(\$2,818)	(\$1,157)	\$14,965	\$14,965
2002	44	1.31	1.04579	62,085	2,510	(1,638)	(9,322)	(3,828)	49,807	49,807
2003	45	2.31	1.04380	64,804	2,620	(1,710)	(9,731)	(3,996)	51,988	51,988
2004	46	3.31	1.04182	67,514	2,730	(1,781)	(10,138)	(4,163)	54,162	54,162
2005	47	4.31	1.03984	70,204	2,838	(1,852)	(10,541)	(4,328)	56,320	56,320
2006	48	5.31	1.03786	72,861	2,946	(1,922)	(10,941)	(4,492)	58,452	58,452
2007	49	6.31	1.03588	75,476	3,052	(1,991)	(11,333)	(4,654)	60,549	60,549
2008	50	7.31	1.03391	78,035	3,155	(2,059)	(11,717)	(4,811)	62,603	62,603
2009	51	8.31	1.03194	80,528	3,256	(2,124)	(12,092)	(4,965)	64,602	64,602
2010	52	9.31	1.03000	82,944	3,353	(2,188)	(12,454)	(5,114)	66,540	66,540
2011	53	10.31	1.03000	85,432	3,454	(2,254)	(12,828)	(6,549)	67,255	67,255
2012	54	11.31	1.03000	87,995	3,558	(2,321)	(13,213)	(6,745)	69,273	69,273
2013	55	12.31	1.03000	90,635	3,664	(2,391)	(13,609)	(9,192)	69,107	69,107
2014	56	13.31	1.03000	93,354	3,774	(2,463)	(14,018)	(13,975)	66,672	66,672
2015	57	14.31	1.03000	96,154	3,888	(2,537)	(14,438)	(14,395)	68,672	68,672
2016	58	15.31	1.03000	99,039	4,004	(2,613)	(14,871)	(14,826)	70,733	70,733
2017	59	16.31	1.03000	102,010	4,124	(2,691)	(15,317)	(15,271)	72,855	72,855
2018	60	17.31	1.03000	105,070	4,248	(2,772)	(15,777)	(15,729)	75,040	75,040
2019	61	18.31	1.03000	108,222	4,376	(2,855)	(16,250)	(16,201)	77,291	77,291
2020	62	18.81	1.03000	55,735	2,253	(1,470)	(8,369)	(8,344)	39,805	39,364
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,596,300</b>	<b>\$64,539</b>	<b>(\$41,632)</b>	<b>(\$239,779)</b>	<b>(\$162,736)</b>	<b>\$1,216,693</b>	<b>\$1,216,252</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	7.520%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. DONNA BOWEN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	43	0.31	\$728	\$0	\$0	(\$55)	\$673	\$673
2002	44	1.31	2,483	0	0	(187)	2,297	2,297
2003	45	2.31	2,514	0	0	(189)	2,325	2,325
2004	46	3.31	2,620	0	0	(197)	2,423	2,423
2005	47	4.31	2,724	0	0	(205)	2,519	2,519
2006	48	5.31	2,827	0	0	(213)	2,614	2,614
2007	49	6.31	2,928	0	0	(220)	2,708	2,708
2008	50	7.31	3,028	0	0	(228)	2,800	2,800
2009	51	8.31	3,124	0	0	(235)	2,889	2,889
2010	52	9.31	3,218	0	0	(242)	2,976	2,976
2011	53	10.31	3,315	0	0	(310)	3,005	3,005
2012	54	11.31	3,414	0	0	(319)	3,095	3,095
2013	55	12.31	3,517	0	0	(435)	3,082	3,082
2014	56	13.31	3,622	0	0	(661)	2,961	2,961
2015	57	14.31	3,731	0	0	(681)	3,050	3,050
2016	58	15.31	3,843	0	0	(702)	3,141	3,141
2017	59	16.31	3,958	0	0	(723)	3,235	3,235
2018	60	17.31	4,077	0	0	(744)	3,332	3,332
2019	61	18.31	4,199	0	0	(767)	3,432	3,432
2020	62	18.81	2,163	0	0	(395)	1,768	1,748
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$62,033</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$7,707)</b>	<b>\$54,326</b>	<b>\$54,306</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. DONNA BOWEN**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	43	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	44	1.31			0	0
2003	45	2.31			0	0
2004	46	3.31			0	0
2005	47	4.31			0	0
2006	48	5.31			0	0
2007	49	6.31			0	0
2008	50	7.31			0	0
2009	51	8.31			0	0
2010	52	9.31			0	0
2011	53	10.31			0	0
2012	54	11.31			0	0
2013	55	12.31			0	0
2014	56	13.31			0	0
2015	57	14.31			0	0
2016	58	15.31			0	0
2017	59	16.31			0	0
2018	60	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-3**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Sheila Barnes**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 18, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.4%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. SHEILA BARNES**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$450,835
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	84,380
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$535,215</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
51,464	3.0%	16.100%	3,868	18.264%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. SHEILA BARNES**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	55	0.31	1.00000	\$15,781	\$1,186	\$0	(\$2,541)	(\$2,418)	\$12,008	\$12,008
2002	56	1.31	1.03000	53,008	3,984	(1,434)	(8,278)	(7,879)	39,400	39,400
2003	57	2.31	1.03000	54,598	4,103	(1,478)	(8,527)	(8,115)	40,582	40,582
2004	58	3.31	1.03000	56,236	4,226	(1,522)	(8,782)	(8,359)	41,800	41,800
2005	59	4.31	1.03000	57,923	4,353	(1,568)	(9,046)	(8,610)	43,054	43,054
2006	60	5.31	1.03000	59,661	4,484	(1,615)	(9,317)	(8,868)	44,345	44,345
2007	61	6.31	1.03000	61,451	4,618	(1,663)	(9,597)	(9,134)	45,676	45,676
2008	62	7.31	1.03000	63,295	4,757	(1,713)	(9,885)	(9,408)	47,046	47,046
2009	63	8.31	1.03000	65,193	4,900	(1,764)	(10,181)	(9,690)	48,457	48,457
2010	64	9.31	1.03000	67,149	5,047	(1,817)	(10,487)	(9,981)	49,911	49,911
2011	65	10.06	1.03000	51,873	3,898	(1,404)	(8,101)	(7,710)	38,556	38,556
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$606,170</b>	<b>\$45,556</b>	<b>(\$15,977)</b>	<b>(\$94,742)</b>	<b>(\$90,172)</b>	<b>\$450,835</b>	<b>\$450,835</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	18.264%	0.000%	4.405%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. SHEILA BARNES**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	NET PENSION (PROJECTED-VESTED)	401 (K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	55	0.31	\$0	\$545	\$0	(\$100)	\$445	\$445
2002	56	1.31	0	1,831	0	(334)	1,496	1,496
2003	57	2.31	0	1,829	0	(334)	1,495	1,495
2004	58	3.31	0	1,884	0	(344)	1,540	1,540
2005	59	4.31	0	1,940	0	(354)	1,586	1,586
2006	60	5.31	0	1,999	0	(365)	1,633	1,633
2007	61	6.31	0	2,058	0	(376)	1,683	1,683
2008	62	7.31	0	2,120	0	(387)	1,733	1,733
2009	63	8.31	0	2,184	0	(399)	1,785	1,785
2010	64	9.31	0	2,249	0	(411)	1,839	1,839
2011	65	10.31	5,362	1,738	(1,533)	(1,017)	4,549	4,549
2012	66	11.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2013	67	12.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2014	68	13.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2015	69	14.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2016	70	15.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2017	71	16.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2018	72	17.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2019	73	18.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,581
2020	74	19.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,499
2021	75	20.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,351
2022	76	21.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,208
2023	77	22.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	4,070
2024	78	23.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	3,936
2025	79	24.31	7,149	0	(1,544)	(1,024)	4,581	3,807
2026	80	25.14	5,958	0	(1,287)	(853)	3,818	3,077
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$111,406</b>	<b>\$20,376</b>	<b>(\$24,439)</b>	<b>(\$19,605)</b>	<b>\$87,738</b>	<b>\$84,380</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. SHEILA BARNES**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	55	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	56	1.31			0	0
2003	57	2.31			0	0
2004	58	3.31			0	0
2005	59	4.31			0	0
2006	60	5.31			0	0
2007	61	6.31			0	0
2008	62	7.31			0	0
2009	63	8.31			0	0
2010	64	9.31			0	0
2011	65	10.31			0	0
2012	66	11.31			0	0
2013	67	12.31			0	0
2014	68	13.31			0	0
2015	69	14.31			0	0
2016	70	15.31			0	0
2017	71	16.31			0	0
2018	72	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-4**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Richard Allen**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **August 27, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

For economic loss, the amount that was awarded by **The Fund** was \$170,413 (or 73.5%) higher than that set forth in their Valuation Model. The amount computed by the model was \$280,049, whereas the amount that **The Fund** determined to be the appropriate value of economic loss was \$450,462. In order to update the present value, earnings, benefits, and pension were increased by 73.5%.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. RICHARD ALLEN**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$937,144
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	105,283
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,042,427</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
48,059	3.0%	10.460%	4,351	73.550%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. RICHARD ALLEN**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	30	0.31	1.00000	\$14,737	\$1,334	\$0	(\$1,541)	(\$9,705)	\$4,824	\$4,824
2002	31	1.31	1.07201	51,520	4,664	(1,509)	(5,227)	(32,912)	16,536	16,536
2003	32	2.31	1.06997	55,125	4,991	(1,615)	(5,593)	(35,214)	17,693	17,693
2004	33	3.31	1.06794	58,870	5,330	(1,725)	(5,973)	(37,607)	18,896	18,896
2005	34	4.31	1.06591	62,750	5,681	(1,838)	(6,367)	(40,085)	20,141	20,141
2006	35	5.31	1.06388	66,758	6,044	(1,956)	(6,773)	(42,646)	21,427	21,427
2007	36	6.31	1.06185	70,887	6,418	(2,077)	(7,192)	(45,284)	22,753	22,753
2008	37	7.31	1.05983	75,129	6,802	(2,201)	(7,623)	(47,993)	24,114	24,114
2009	38	8.31	1.05781	79,472	7,195	(2,328)	(8,063)	(50,768)	25,508	25,508
2010	39	9.31	1.05580	83,907	7,596	(2,458)	(8,513)	(53,601)	26,932	26,932
2011	40	10.31	1.05379	88,421	8,005	(2,590)	(8,971)	(56,484)	28,380	28,380
2012	41	11.31	1.05179	93,000	8,420	(2,724)	(9,436)	(59,409)	29,850	29,850
2013	42	12.31	1.04979	97,630	8,839	(2,860)	(9,906)	(62,367)	31,336	31,336
2014	43	13.31	1.04779	102,295	9,261	(2,997)	(10,379)	(65,347)	32,834	32,834
2015	44	14.31	1.04579	106,980	9,685	(3,134)	(10,854)	(68,340)	34,337	34,337
2016	45	15.31	1.04380	111,666	10,110	(3,271)	(11,330)	(71,333)	35,841	35,841
2017	46	16.31	1.04182	116,336	10,532	(3,408)	(11,804)	(74,316)	37,340	37,340
2018	47	17.31	1.03984	120,970	10,952	(3,544)	(12,274)	(77,277)	38,828	38,828
2019	48	18.31	1.03786	125,549	11,367	(3,678)	(12,738)	(80,202)	40,297	40,297
2020	49	19.31	1.03588	130,054	11,774	(3,810)	(13,196)	(83,080)	41,743	40,826
2021	50	20.31	1.03391	134,464	12,174	(3,939)	(13,643)	(85,897)	43,159	40,509
2022	51	21.31	1.03194	138,760	12,563	(4,065)	(14,079)	(88,641)	44,538	40,118
2023	52	22.31	1.03000	142,922	12,939	(4,187)	(14,501)	(91,300)	45,874	39,656
2024	53	23.31	1.03000	147,210	13,328	(4,312)	(14,936)	(94,039)	47,250	39,200
2025	54	24.31	1.03000	151,626	13,727	(4,442)	(15,384)	(96,860)	48,667	38,748
2026	55	25.31	1.03000	156,175	14,139	(4,575)	(15,846)	(99,766)	50,127	38,302
2027	56	26.31	1.03000	160,860	14,563	(4,712)	(16,321)	(102,759)	51,631	37,861
2028	57	27.31	1.03000	165,686	15,000	(4,854)	(16,811)	(105,842)	53,180	37,425
2029	58	28.31	1.03000	170,657	15,450	(4,999)	(17,315)	(109,017)	54,776	36,994
2030	59	29.31	1.03000	175,776	15,914	(5,149)	(17,835)	(112,288)	56,419	36,568
2031	60	29.39	1.03000	15,086	1,366	(442)	(1,531)	(9,637)	4,842	3,069
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$3,271,281</b>	<b>\$296,164</b>	<b>(\$95,397)</b>	<b>(\$331,957)</b>	<b>(\$2,090,017)</b>	<b>\$1,050,074</b>	<b>\$937,144</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	10.460%	73.550%	4.000%	2.610%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MR. RICHARD ALLEN

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	30	0.31	\$589	\$344	\$0	(\$687)	\$247	\$247
2002	31	1.31	2,061	1,168	0	(2,375)	854	854
2003	32	2.31	2,139	1,250	0	(2,492)	896	896
2004	33	3.31	2,284	1,335	0	(2,662)	957	957
2005	34	4.31	2,435	1,422	0	(2,837)	1,020	1,020
2006	35	5.31	2,590	1,513	0	(3,018)	1,085	1,085
2007	36	6.31	2,750	1,607	0	(3,205)	1,153	1,153
2008	37	7.31	2,915	1,703	0	(3,397)	1,221	1,221
2009	38	8.31	3,084	1,802	0	(3,593)	1,292	1,292
2010	39	9.31	3,256	1,902	0	(3,793)	1,364	1,364
2011	40	10.31	3,431	2,004	0	(3,998)	1,438	1,438
2012	41	11.31	3,608	2,108	0	(4,205)	1,512	1,512
2013	42	12.31	3,788	2,213	0	(4,414)	1,587	1,587
2014	43	13.31	3,969	2,319	0	(4,625)	1,663	1,663
2015	44	14.31	4,151	2,425	0	(4,837)	1,739	1,739
2016	45	15.31	4,333	2,531	0	(5,048)	1,816	1,816
2017	46	16.31	4,514	2,637	0	(5,260)	1,891	1,891
2018	47	17.31	4,694	2,742	0	(5,469)	1,967	1,967
2019	48	18.31	585	2,846	0	(2,524)	908	908
2020	49	19.31	0	2,948	0	(2,168)	780	763
2021	50	20.31	0	3,048	0	(2,242)	806	757
2022	51	21.31	0	3,146	0	(2,314)	832	749
2023	52	22.31	0	3,240	0	(2,383)	857	741
2024	53	23.31	0	3,337	0	(2,454)	883	732
2025	54	24.31	0	3,437	0	(2,528)	909	724
2026	55	25.31	0	3,540	0	(2,604)	936	716
2027	56	26.31	0	3,647	0	(2,682)	965	707
2028	57	27.31	0	3,756	0	(2,762)	993	699
2029	58	28.31	0	3,869	0	(2,845)	1,023	691
2030	59	29.31	0	3,985	0	(2,931)	1,054	683
2031	60	30.31	0	342	0	(252)	90	56
2032	61	31.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2033	62	32.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2034	63	33.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2035	64	34.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2036	65	35.31	24,906	0	(2,605)	(16,402)	5,898	2,987
2037	66	36.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	6,879
2038	67	37.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	6,602
2039	68	38.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	6,336
2040	69	39.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	6,081
2041	70	40.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	5,836
2042	71	41.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	5,600
2043	72	42.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	5,375
2044	73	43.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	5,158
2045	74	44.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	4,950
2046	75	45.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	4,751
2047	76	46.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	4,559
2048	77	47.31	59,773	0	(6,252)	(39,365)	14,156	4,375
2049	78	48.06	44,830	0	(4,689)	(29,524)	10,617	3,165
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$844,191</b>	<b>\$74,166</b>	<b>(\$82,322)</b>	<b>(\$614,904)</b>	<b>\$221,131</b>	<b>\$105,283</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. RICHARD ALLEN**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	30	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	31	1.31			0	0
2003	32	2.31			0	0
2004	33	3.31			0	0
2005	34	4.31			0	0
2006	35	5.31			0	0
2007	36	6.31			0	0
2008	37	7.31			0	0
2009	38	8.31			0	0
2010	39	9.31			0	0
2011	40	10.31			0	0
2012	41	11.31			0	0
2013	42	12.31			0	0
2014	43	13.31			0	0
2015	44	14.31			0	0
2016	45	15.31			0	0
2017	46	16.31			0	0
2018	47	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-5**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Kenneth Cubas**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 24, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. KENNETH CUBAS**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,756,123
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	108,484
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	375,861
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,240,468</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
143,305	3.0%	25.000%	7,703	12.490%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. KENNETH CUBAS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	48	0.31	1.00000	\$43,943	\$2,362	\$0	(\$10,986)	(\$4,116)	\$31,203	\$31,203
2002	49	1.31	1.03588	148,447	7,979	(3,520)	(35,998)	(13,489)	103,420	103,420
2003	50	2.31	1.03391	153,481	8,250	(3,639)	(37,219)	(13,946)	106,927	106,927
2004	51	3.31	1.03194	158,383	8,513	(3,755)	(38,408)	(14,391)	110,342	110,342
2005	52	4.31	1.03000	163,135	8,769	(3,868)	(39,560)	(14,823)	113,652	113,652
2006	53	5.31	1.03000	168,029	9,032	(3,984)	(40,747)	(15,268)	117,062	117,062
2007	54	6.31	1.03000	173,070	9,303	(4,103)	(41,969)	(15,726)	120,574	120,574
2008	55	7.31	1.03000	178,262	9,582	(4,226)	(43,228)	(16,198)	124,191	124,191
2009	56	8.31	1.03000	183,610	9,869	(4,353)	(44,525)	(16,684)	127,917	127,917
2010	57	9.31	1.03000	189,118	10,165	(4,484)	(45,861)	(17,184)	131,754	131,754
2011	58	10.31	1.03000	194,791	10,470	(4,618)	(47,237)	(17,700)	135,707	135,707
2012	59	11.31	1.03000	200,635	10,784	(4,757)	(48,654)	(18,231)	139,778	139,778
2013	60	12.31	1.03000	206,654	11,108	(4,900)	(50,114)	(18,778)	143,971	143,971
2014	61	13.31	1.03000	212,854	11,441	(5,047)	(51,617)	(19,341)	148,290	148,290
2015	62	13.97	1.03000	145,456	7,818	(3,449)	(35,273)	(13,217)	101,336	101,336
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,519,867</b>	<b>\$135,447</b>	<b>(\$58,703)</b>	<b>(\$611,397)</b>	<b>(\$229,091)</b>	<b>\$1,756,123</b>	<b>\$1,756,123</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	12.490%	4.000%	1.060%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. KENNETH CUBAS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	48	0.31	\$1,758	\$466	\$0	(\$278)	\$1,946	\$1,946
2002	49	1.31	5,938	\$1,573	0	(938)	6,573	6,573
2003	50	2.31	5,955	\$1,578	0	(941)	6,592	6,592
2004	51	3.31	6,145	\$1,628	0	(971)	6,803	6,803
2005	52	4.31	6,330	\$1,677	0	(1,000)	7,007	7,007
2006	53	5.31	6,520	\$1,727	0	(1,030)	7,217	7,217
2007	54	6.31	6,715	\$1,779	0	(1,061)	7,433	7,433
2008	55	7.31	6,917	\$1,833	0	(1,093)	7,656	7,656
2009	56	8.31	7,124	\$1,888	0	(1,126)	7,886	7,886
2010	57	9.31	7,338	\$1,944	0	(1,159)	8,123	8,123
2011	58	10.31	7,558	\$2,002	0	(1,194)	8,366	8,366
2012	59	11.31	7,785	\$2,063	0	(1,230)	8,617	8,617
2013	60	12.31	8,018	\$2,124	0	(1,267)	8,876	8,876
2014	61	13.31	8,259	\$2,188	0	(1,305)	9,142	9,142
2015	62	13.97	5,644	\$1,495	0	(892)	6,247	6,247
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$98,002</b>	<b>\$25,966</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$15,484)</b>	<b>\$108,484</b>	<b>\$108,484</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. KENNETH CUBAS**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	48	0.31	\$3,187	\$431	\$3,617	\$3,617
2002	49	1.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2003	50	2.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2004	51	3.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2005	52	4.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2006	53	5.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2007	54	6.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2008	55	7.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2009	56	8.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2010	57	9.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2011	58	10.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2012	59	11.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2013	60	12.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2014	61	13.31	12,228	1,404	13,632	13,632
2015	62	14.31	11,373	1,404	12,777	12,777
2016	63	15.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	11,052
2017	64	16.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	11,052
2018	65	17.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	11,052
2019	66	18.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	11,052
2020	67	19.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	10,826
2021	68	20.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	10,420
2022	69	21.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	10,029
2023	70	22.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	9,652
2024	71	23.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	9,290
2025	72	24.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	8,941
2026	73	25.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	8,605
2027	74	26.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	8,282
2028	75	27.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	7,972
2029	76	28.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	7,672
2030	77	29.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	7,384
2031	78	30.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	7,107
2032	79	31.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	6,840
2033	80	32.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	6,584
2034	81	33.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	6,336
2035	82	34.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	6,099
2036	83	35.31	9,648	1,404	11,052	5,870
2037	84	35.33	225	33	258	134
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$376,357</b>	<b>\$49,603</b>	<b>\$425,960</b>	<b>\$375,861</b>

# **Exhibit B-6**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Robert Baierwalter**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 5, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. ROBERT BAIERWALTER**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,162,191
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	530,494
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,692,685</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
114,261	3.0%	21.600%	7,941	5.419%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. ROBERT BAIERWALTER**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	44	0.31	1.00000	\$35,037	\$2,435	\$0	(\$7,568)	(\$1,488)	\$28,416	\$28,416
2002	45	1.31	1.04380	119,266	8,289	(3,000)	(24,989)	(4,915)	94,651	94,651
2003	46	2.31	1.04182	124,254	8,635	(3,126)	(26,034)	(5,120)	98,610	98,610
2004	47	3.31	1.03984	129,203	8,979	(3,250)	(27,071)	(5,324)	102,538	102,538
2005	48	4.31	1.03786	134,094	9,319	(3,373)	(28,095)	(5,526)	106,419	106,419
2006	49	5.31	1.03588	138,906	9,654	(3,494)	(29,104)	(5,724)	110,238	110,238
2007	50	6.31	1.03391	143,616	9,981	(3,613)	(30,090)	(5,918)	113,976	113,976
2008	51	7.31	1.03194	148,204	10,300	(3,728)	(31,052)	(7,529)	116,195	116,195
2009	52	8.31	1.03000	152,650	10,609	(3,840)	(31,983)	(7,755)	119,681	119,681
2010	53	9.31	1.03000	157,229	10,927	(3,955)	(32,943)	(7,987)	123,271	123,271
2011	54	10.31	1.03000	161,946	11,255	(4,074)	(33,931)	(10,715)	124,482	124,482
2012	55	11.31	1.03000	166,805	11,593	(4,196)	(34,949)	(11,036)	128,216	128,216
2013	56	12.31	1.03000	171,809	11,940	(4,322)	(35,997)	(11,367)	132,063	132,063
2014	57	13.31	1.03000	176,963	12,299	(4,451)	(37,077)	(11,708)	136,025	136,025
2015	58	14.31	1.03000	182,272	12,668	(4,585)	(38,190)	(17,313)	134,852	134,852
2016	59	15.31	1.03000	187,740	13,048	(4,723)	(39,335)	(17,832)	138,898	138,898
2017	60	16.31	1.03000	193,372	13,439	(4,864)	(40,515)	(18,367)	143,064	143,064
2018	61	17.31	1.03000	199,173	13,842	(5,010)	(41,731)	(18,918)	147,356	147,356
2019	62	17.72	1.03000	85,478	5,941	(2,150)	(17,909)	(8,119)	63,240	63,240
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,808,017</b>	<b>\$195,151</b>	<b>(\$69,753)</b>	<b>(\$588,563)</b>	<b>(\$182,662)</b>	<b>\$2,162,191</b>	<b>\$2,162,191</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	5.419%	4.000%	4.704%

## EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS

MR. ROBERT BAIERWALTER

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	NET PENSION (PROJECTED - VESTED)	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	44	0.31	\$0	\$1,292	\$0	(\$70)	\$1,222	\$1,222
2002	45	1.31	0	4,398	0	(238)	4,160	4,160
2003	46	2.31	0	4,445	0	(241)	4,204	4,204
2004	47	3.31	0	4,622	0	(250)	4,372	4,372
2005	48	4.31	0	4,797	0	(260)	4,537	4,537
2006	49	5.31	0	4,969	0	(269)	4,700	4,700
2007	50	6.31	0	5,138	0	(278)	4,859	4,859
2008	51	7.31	0	5,302	0	(354)	4,948	4,948
2009	52	8.31	0	5,461	0	(365)	5,096	5,096
2010	53	9.31	0	5,625	0	(376)	5,249	5,249
2011	54	10.31	0	5,793	0	(504)	5,289	5,289
2012	55	11.31	0	5,967	0	(519)	5,448	5,448
2013	56	12.31	0	6,146	0	(535)	5,611	5,611
2014	57	13.31	0	6,330	0	(551)	5,780	5,780
2015	58	14.31	0	6,520	0	(814)	5,706	5,706
2016	59	15.31	0	6,716	0	(839)	5,877	5,877
2017	60	16.31	0	6,918	0	(864)	6,054	6,054
2018	61	17.31	0	7,125	0	(890)	6,235	6,235
2019	62	18.31	0	3,058	0	(382)	2,676	2,676
2020	63	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	64	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	65	21.31	37,278	0	(8,052)	(3,650)	25,576	23,207
2023	66	22.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	38,290
2024	67	23.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	36,853
2025	68	24.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	35,470
2026	69	25.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	34,138
2027	70	26.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	32,857
2028	71	27.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	31,624
2029	72	28.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	30,437
2030	73	29.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	29,294
2031	74	30.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	28,194
2032	75	31.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	27,136
2033	76	32.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	26,118
2034	77	33.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	25,137
2035	78	34.31	63,905	0	(13,803)	(6,258)	43,844	24,194
2036	79	35.31	42,603	0	(9,202)	(4,172)	29,229	15,524
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$910,646</b>	<b>\$100,622</b>	<b>(\$196,700)</b>	<b>(\$97,771)</b>	<b>\$716,797</b>	<b>\$530,494</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. ROBERT BAIERWALTER**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	44	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	45	1.31			0	0
2003	46	2.31			0	0
2004	47	3.31			0	0
2005	48	4.31			0	0
2006	49	5.31			0	0
2007	50	6.31			0	0
2008	51	7.31			0	0
2009	52	8.31			0	0
2010	53	9.31			0	0
2011	54	10.31			0	0
2012	55	11.31			0	0
2013	56	12.31			0	0
2014	57	13.31			0	0
2015	58	14.31			0	0
2016	59	15.31			0	0
2017	60	16.31			0	0
2018	61	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-7**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Lawrence Irwin Davidson**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **December 19, 2002**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. LAWRENCE IRWIN DAVIDSON**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$624,316
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	60,282
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$684,597</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
102,540	3.0%	21.600%	2,426	48.040%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. LAWRENCE IRWIN DAVIDSON**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	51	0.31	1.00000	\$31,443	\$744	\$0	(\$6,792)	(\$11,842)	\$13,553	\$13,553
2002	52	1.31	1.03000	105,617	2,499	(2,543)	(22,129)	(38,585)	44,859	44,859
2003	53	2.31	1.03000	108,785	2,574	(2,619)	(22,793)	(39,743)	46,204	46,204
2004	54	3.31	1.03000	112,049	2,651	(2,698)	(23,476)	(40,935)	47,591	47,591
2005	55	4.31	1.03000	115,410	2,731	(2,779)	(24,181)	(42,163)	49,018	49,018
2006	56	5.31	1.03000	118,872	2,813	(2,862)	(24,906)	(43,428)	50,489	50,489
2007	57	6.31	1.03000	122,439	2,897	(2,948)	(25,653)	(44,731)	52,003	52,003
2008	58	7.31	1.03000	126,112	2,984	(3,036)	(26,423)	(46,073)	53,564	53,564
2009	59	8.31	1.03000	129,895	3,074	(3,127)	(27,216)	(47,455)	55,170	55,170
2010	60	9.31	1.03000	133,792	3,166	(3,221)	(28,032)	(48,879)	56,826	56,826
2011	61	10.31	1.03000	137,806	3,261	(3,318)	(28,873)	(50,345)	58,530	58,530
2012	62	11.31	1.03000	141,940	3,359	(3,417)	(29,739)	(51,856)	60,286	60,286
2013	63	11.89	1.03000	85,283	2,018	(2,053)	(17,869)	(31,157)	36,222	36,222
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,469,443</b>	<b>\$34,770</b>	<b>(\$34,622)</b>	<b>(\$308,081)</b>	<b>(\$537,194)</b>	<b>\$624,316</b>	<b>\$624,316</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	48.040%	4.000%	4.116%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. LAWRENCE IRWIN DAVIDSON**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	51	0.31	\$1,258	\$1,294	\$0	(\$1,226)	\$1,326	\$1,326
2002	52	1.31	4,225	4,347	0	(4,118)	4,454	4,454
2003	53	2.31	4,221	4,343	0	(4,114)	4,450	4,450
2004	54	3.31	4,347	4,474	0	(4,238)	4,583	4,583
2005	55	4.31	4,478	4,608	0	(4,365)	4,721	4,721
2006	56	5.31	4,612	4,746	0	(4,496)	4,863	4,863
2007	57	6.31	4,751	4,888	0	(4,631)	5,008	5,008
2008	58	7.31	4,893	5,035	0	(4,769)	5,159	5,159
2009	59	8.31	5,040	5,186	0	(4,913)	5,313	5,313
2010	60	9.31	5,191	5,342	0	(5,060)	5,473	5,473
2011	61	10.31	5,347	5,502	0	(5,212)	5,637	5,637
2012	62	11.31	5,507	5,667	0	(5,368)	5,806	5,806
2013	63	11.89	3,309	3,405	0	(3,225)	3,489	3,489
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$57,179</b>	<b>\$58,837</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$55,734)</b>	<b>\$60,282</b>	<b>\$60,282</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. LAWRENCE IRWIN DAVIDSON**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	51	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	52	1.31			0	0
2003	53	2.31			0	0
2004	54	3.31			0	0
2005	55	4.31			0	0
2006	56	5.31			0	0
2007	57	6.31			0	0
2008	58	7.31			0	0
2009	59	8.31			0	0
2010	60	9.31			0	0
2011	61	10.31			0	0
2012	62	11.31			0	0
2013	63	12.31			0	0
2014	64	13.31			0	0
2015	65	14.31			0	0
2016	66	15.31			0	0
2017	67	16.31			0	0
2018	68	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-8**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Carl Asaro**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **April 13, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. CARL ASARO**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,253,158
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	466,033
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,719,191</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
69,932	3.0%	17.270%	7,621	17.812%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. CARL ASARO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	40	0.31	1.00000	\$21,444	\$2,337	\$0	(\$3,703)	(\$935)	\$19,143	\$19,143
2002	41	1.31	1.05179	73,554	8,016	(2,024)	(12,322)	(3,110)	64,114	64,114
2003	42	2.31	1.04979	77,216	8,415	(2,125)	(12,935)	(3,265)	67,306	67,306
2004	43	3.31	1.04779	80,906	8,817	(2,227)	(13,553)	(3,421)	70,522	70,522
2005	44	4.31	1.04579	84,611	9,221	(2,329)	(14,174)	(3,577)	73,752	73,752
2006	45	5.31	1.04380	88,317	9,625	(2,431)	(14,795)	(3,734)	76,982	76,982
2007	46	6.31	1.04182	92,010	10,027	(2,532)	(15,413)	(3,890)	80,202	80,202
2008	47	7.31	1.03984	95,675	10,427	(2,633)	(16,027)	(5,631)	81,810	81,810
2009	48	8.31	1.03786	99,297	10,822	(2,733)	(16,634)	(7,270)	83,482	83,482
2010	49	9.31	1.03588	102,860	11,210	(2,831)	(17,231)	(7,531)	86,477	86,477
2011	50	10.31	1.03391	106,348	11,590	(2,927)	(17,815)	(10,298)	86,898	86,898
2012	51	11.31	1.03194	109,745	11,960	(3,021)	(18,384)	(10,627)	89,674	89,674
2013	52	12.31	1.03000	113,038	12,319	(3,111)	(18,936)	(10,946)	92,364	92,364
2014	53	13.31	1.03000	116,429	12,689	(3,205)	(19,504)	(16,642)	89,766	89,766
2015	54	14.31	1.03000	119,922	13,069	(3,301)	(20,089)	(17,142)	92,459	92,459
2016	55	15.31	1.03000	123,519	13,461	(3,400)	(20,692)	(17,656)	95,233	95,233
2017	56	16.31	1.03000	127,225	13,865	(3,502)	(21,313)	(18,186)	98,090	98,090
2018	57	17.31	1.03000	131,042	14,281	(3,607)	(21,952)	(18,731)	101,033	101,033
2019	58	18.31	1.03000	134,973	14,710	(3,715)	(22,611)	(19,293)	104,064	104,064
2020	59	19.31	1.03000	139,022	15,151	(3,826)	(23,289)	(19,872)	107,186	104,994
2021	60	20.31	1.03000	143,193	15,605	(3,941)	(23,988)	(20,468)	110,401	104,084
2022	61	21.31	1.03000	147,489	16,074	(4,059)	(24,707)	(21,082)	113,713	103,183
2023	62	22.31	1.03000	151,913	16,556	(4,181)	(25,448)	(21,715)	117,125	102,289
2024	63	23.31	1.03000	156,471	17,052	(4,307)	(26,212)	(22,366)	120,639	101,403
2025	64	24.31	1.03000	161,165	17,564	(4,436)	(26,998)	(23,037)	124,258	100,525
2026	65	25.14	1.03000	138,332	15,076	(3,807)	(23,173)	(19,773)	106,654	83,308
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,935,716</b>	<b>\$319,939</b>	<b>(\$80,212)</b>	<b>(\$491,899)</b>	<b>(\$330,196)</b>	<b>\$2,353,348</b>	<b>\$2,253,158</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	17.812%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. CARL ASARO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIB.	PROJECTED PENSION	VESTED PENSION	TAXES & CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	40	0.31	(\$445)	\$0	\$0	\$0	(\$445)	(\$445)
2002	41	1.31	(1,525)	0	0	0	(1,525)	(1,525)
2003	42	2.31	(1,541)	0	0	0	(1,541)	(1,541)
2004	43	3.31	(1,554)	0	0	0	(1,554)	(1,554)
2005	44	4.31	(1,564)	0	0	0	(1,564)	(1,564)
2006	45	5.31	(1,571)	0	0	0	(1,571)	(1,571)
2007	46	6.31	(919)	0	(9,651)	2,483	(8,087)	(8,087)
2008	47	7.31	0	0	(23,163)	6,335	(16,828)	(16,828)
2009	48	8.31	0	0	(23,163)	6,660	(16,503)	(16,503)
2010	49	9.31	0	0	(23,163)	6,660	(16,503)	(16,503)
2011	50	10.31	0	0	(23,163)	7,194	(15,969)	(15,969)
2012	51	11.31	2,994	25,184	(23,163)	(628)	4,388	4,388
2013	52	12.31	3,025	60,442	(23,163)	(11,579)	28,725	28,725
2014	53	13.31	3,051	60,442	(23,163)	(13,258)	27,072	27,072
2015	54	14.31	3,071	60,442	(23,163)	(13,258)	27,092	27,092
2016	55	15.31	3,085	60,442	(23,163)	(13,258)	27,106	27,106
2017	56	16.31	3,093	60,442	(23,343)	(13,194)	26,998	26,998
2018	57	17.31	3,096	60,442	(23,523)	(13,130)	26,885	26,885
2019	58	18.31	3,092	60,442	(23,703)	(13,066)	26,765	26,765
2020	59	19.31	3,083	60,442	(23,883)	(13,002)	26,640	26,095
2021	60	20.31	3,068	60,442	(24,063)	(12,938)	26,509	24,992
2022	61	21.31	3,047	60,622	(24,243)	(12,938)	26,488	24,035
2023	62	22.31	3,021	60,802	(24,423)	(12,938)	26,462	23,110
2024	63	23.31	2,995	60,982	(24,603)	(12,938)	26,436	22,220
2025	64	24.31	2,969	61,162	(24,783)	(12,938)	26,410	21,365
2026	65	25.31	2,453	61,342	(24,963)	(12,938)	25,893	20,161
2027	66	26.31	0	61,522	(25,143)	(12,938)	23,441	17,567
2028	67	27.31	0	61,702	(25,323)	(12,938)	23,441	16,907
2029	68	28.31	0	61,882	(25,503)	(12,938)	23,441	16,273
2030	69	29.31	0	62,062	(25,683)	(12,938)	23,441	15,662
2031	70	30.31	0	62,242	(25,863)	(12,938)	23,441	15,074
2032	71	31.31	0	62,422	(26,043)	(12,938)	23,441	14,508
2033	72	32.31	0	62,602	(26,223)	(12,938)	23,441	13,964
2034	73	33.31	0	62,782	(26,403)	(12,938)	23,441	13,439
2035	74	34.31	0	62,962	(26,583)	(12,938)	23,441	12,935
2036	75	35.31	0	63,142	(26,763)	(12,938)	23,441	12,449
2037	76	36.31	0	63,322	(26,943)	(12,938)	23,441	11,982
2038	77	37.31	0	63,502	(27,123)	(12,938)	23,441	11,532
2039	78	38.31	0	63,682	(27,303)	(12,938)	23,441	11,100
2040	79	38.89	0	37,253	(16,032)	(4,415)	16,806	7,720
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$36,025</b>	<b>\$1,725,151</b>	<b>(\$816,579)</b>	<b>(\$325,281)</b>	<b>\$619,316</b>	<b>\$466,033</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. CARL ASARO**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	40	0.31				\$0
2002	41	1.31				0
2003	42	2.31				0
2004	43	3.31				0
2005	44	4.31				0
2006	45	5.31				0
2007	46	6.31				0
2008	47	7.31				0
2009	48	8.31				0
2010	49	9.31				0
2011	50	10.31				0
2012	51	11.31				0
2013	52	12.31				0
2014	53	13.31				0
2015	54	14.31				0
2016	55	15.31				0
2017	56	16.31				0
2018	57	17.31				0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-9**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Daniel Martin Caballero**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 27, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. DANIEL MARTIN CABALLERO**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,050,076
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	354,791
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,404,867</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
35,811	3.0%	21.600%	2,472	71.628%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. DANIEL MARTIN CABALLERO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	22	0.31	1.00000	\$10,981	\$758	\$0	(\$2,372)	(\$6,167)	\$3,201	\$3,201
2002	23	1.31	1.08847	38,979	2,691	(980)	(8,167)	(21,233)	11,290	11,290
2003	24	2.31	1.08640	42,347	2,923	(1,065)	(8,873)	(23,067)	12,266	12,266
2004	25	3.31	1.08434	45,918	3,170	(1,155)	(9,621)	(25,012)	13,300	13,300
2005	26	4.31	1.08227	49,696	3,430	(1,250)	(10,412)	(27,070)	14,394	14,394
2006	27	5.31	1.08021	53,682	3,706	(1,350)	(11,248)	(29,242)	15,549	15,549
2007	28	6.31	1.07816	57,878	3,995	(1,455)	(12,127)	(31,527)	16,764	16,764
2008	29	7.31	1.07611	62,283	4,299	(1,566)	(13,049)	(33,926)	18,040	18,040
2009	30	8.31	1.07406	66,895	4,618	(1,682)	(14,016)	(36,439)	19,376	19,376
2010	31	9.31	1.07201	71,713	4,950	(1,803)	(15,025)	(39,063)	20,771	20,771
2011	32	10.31	1.06997	76,731	5,297	(1,929)	(16,077)	(41,796)	22,225	22,225
2012	33	11.31	1.06794	81,943	5,656	(2,060)	(17,169)	(44,636)	23,735	23,735
2013	34	12.31	1.06591	87,344	6,029	(2,196)	(18,300)	(47,578)	25,299	25,299
2014	35	13.31	1.06388	92,923	6,414	(2,336)	(19,469)	(50,617)	26,915	26,915
2015	36	14.31	1.06185	98,671	6,811	(2,481)	(20,673)	(53,748)	28,580	28,580
2016	37	15.31	1.05983	104,574	7,219	(2,629)	(21,910)	(56,963)	30,290	30,290
2017	38	16.31	1.05781	110,620	7,636	(2,781)	(23,177)	(60,257)	32,041	32,041
2018	39	17.31	1.05580	116,793	8,062	(2,937)	(24,470)	(63,619)	33,829	33,829
2019	40	18.31	1.05379	123,076	8,496	(3,095)	(25,787)	(67,041)	35,649	35,649
2020	41	19.31	1.05179	129,449	8,936	(3,255)	(27,122)	(70,513)	37,495	36,671
2021	42	20.31	1.04979	135,894	9,381	(3,417)	(28,473)	(74,024)	39,362	36,945
2022	43	21.31	1.04779	142,388	9,829	(3,580)	(29,833)	(77,561)	41,243	37,150
2023	44	22.31	1.04579	148,909	10,279	(3,744)	(31,199)	(81,113)	43,131	37,286
2024	45	23.31	1.04380	155,432	10,729	(3,908)	(32,566)	(84,666)	45,021	37,350
2025	46	24.31	1.04182	161,931	11,178	(4,072)	(33,928)	(88,207)	46,903	37,344
2026	47	25.31	1.03984	168,382	11,623	(4,234)	(35,279)	(91,720)	48,772	37,266
2027	48	26.31	1.03786	174,756	12,063	(4,394)	(36,615)	(95,193)	50,618	37,118
2028	49	27.31	1.03588	181,027	12,496	(4,552)	(37,929)	(98,608)	52,434	36,900
2029	50	28.31	1.03391	187,166	12,920	(4,706)	(39,215)	(101,952)	54,212	36,613
2030	51	29.31	1.03194	193,144	13,332	(4,856)	(40,468)	(105,209)	55,944	36,260
2031	52	30.31	1.03000	198,939	13,732	(5,002)	(41,682)	(108,365)	57,622	35,842
2032	53	31.31	1.03000	204,907	14,144	(5,152)	(42,932)	(111,616)	59,351	35,430
2033	54	32.31	1.03000	211,054	14,569	(5,307)	(44,220)	(114,964)	61,131	35,022
2034	55	33.31	1.03000	217,385	15,006	(5,466)	(45,547)	(118,413)	62,965	34,618
2035	56	34.31	1.03000	223,907	15,456	(5,630)	(46,913)	(121,966)	64,854	34,220
2036	57	35.31	1.03000	230,624	15,920	(5,799)	(48,320)	(125,625)	66,800	33,826
2037	58	36.22	1.03000	217,747	15,031	(5,475)	(45,622)	(118,610)	63,070	30,702
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$4,676,090</b>	<b>\$322,783</b>	<b>(\$117,297)</b>	<b>(\$979,805)</b>	<b>(\$2,547,327)</b>	<b>\$1,354,442</b>	<b>\$1,050,076</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	71.628%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. DANIEL MARTIN CABALLERO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIB.	MILITARY PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	22	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	23	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	24	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	25	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	26	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	27	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	28	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	29	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	30	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	31	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	32	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	33	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	34	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	35	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	36	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	37	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	38	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	39	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	40	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	41	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	42	20.31	5,273	12,455	0	(12,698)	5,030	4,721
2022	43	21.31	5,525	50,818	0	(40,357)	15,986	14,399
2023	44	22.31	5,778	51,834	0	(41,266)	16,346	14,130
2024	45	23.31	6,031	52,871	0	(42,190)	16,712	13,864
2025	46	24.31	6,283	53,928	0	(43,128)	17,083	13,601
2026	47	25.31	6,533	55,007	0	(44,080)	17,460	13,341
2027	48	26.31	6,781	56,107	0	(45,045)	17,842	13,084
2028	49	27.31	7,024	57,229	0	(46,023)	18,230	12,829
2029	50	28.31	7,262	58,374	0	(47,014)	18,622	12,577
2030	51	29.31	7,494	59,541	0	(48,016)	19,019	12,327
2031	52	30.31	7,719	60,732	0	(49,030)	19,421	12,080
2032	53	31.31	7,950	61,947	0	(50,066)	19,831	11,838
2033	54	32.31	8,189	63,186	0	(51,124)	20,251	11,601
2034	55	33.31	8,435	64,450	0	(52,206)	20,679	11,369
2035	56	34.31	8,688	65,739	0	(53,310)	21,116	11,142
2036	57	35.31	8,948	67,054	0	(54,439)	21,563	10,919
2037	58	36.31	8,449	68,395	0	(55,041)	21,802	10,595
2038	59	37.31	0	69,763	0	(49,970)	19,793	9,231
2039	60	38.31	0	71,158	0	(50,969)	20,189	9,036
2040	61	39.31	0	72,581	0	(51,988)	20,593	8,845
2041	62	40.31	0	74,033	0	(53,028)	21,005	8,659
2042	63	41.31	0	75,514	0	(54,089)	21,425	8,476
2043	64	42.31	0	77,024	0	(55,171)	21,853	8,297
2044	65	43.31	0	78,564	0	(56,274)	22,290	8,122
2045	66	44.31	0	80,135	0	(57,399)	22,736	7,950
2046	67	45.31	0	81,738	0	(58,547)	23,191	7,782
2047	68	46.31	0	83,373	0	(59,718)	23,655	7,618
2048	69	47.31	0	85,040	0	(60,912)	24,128	7,457
2049	70	48.31	0	86,741	0	(62,131)	24,610	7,300
2050	71	49.31	0	88,476	0	(63,374)	25,102	7,146
2051	72	50.31	0	90,246	0	(64,641)	25,605	6,995
2052	73	51.31	0	92,051	0	(65,934)	26,117	6,847
2053	74	52.31	0	93,892	0	(67,253)	26,639	6,702
2054	75	53.31	0	95,770	0	(68,598)	27,172	6,561
2055	76	54.31	0	97,685	0	(69,970)	27,715	6,422
2056	77	55.31	0	99,639	0	(71,369)	28,270	6,287
2057	78	56.06	0	76,224	0	(54,598)	21,626	4,639
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$122,359</b>	<b>\$2,629,314</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$1,970,968)</b>	<b>\$780,706</b>	<b>\$354,791</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. DANIEL MARTIN CABALLERO**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	22	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	23	1.31			0	0
2003	24	2.31			0	0
2004	25	3.31			0	0
2005	26	4.31			0	0
2006	27	5.31			0	0
2007	28	6.31			0	0
2008	29	7.31			0	0
2009	30	8.31			0	0
2010	31	9.31			0	0
2011	32	10.31			0	0
2012	33	11.31			0	0
2013	34	12.31			0	0
2014	35	13.31			0	0
2015	36	14.31			0	0
2016	37	15.31			0	0
2017	38	16.31			0	0
2018	39	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-10**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Geoffrey W. Cloud**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **September 8, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	5.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. GEOFFREY W. CLOUD**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$10,493,547
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	0
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	199,221
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$10,692,768</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
438,257	3.0%	35.170%	0	8.53-11.60%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. GEOFFREY W. CLOUD**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	36	0.31	1.00000	\$134,387	\$0	\$0	(\$47,264)	(\$7,429)	\$79,694	\$79,694
2002	37	1.31	1.05983	464,478	0	(9,034)	(158,456)	(24,906)	272,082	272,082
2003	38	2.31	1.05781	491,332	0	(9,556)	(167,617)	(26,346)	287,812	287,812
2004	39	3.31	1.05580	518,749	0	(10,089)	(176,971)	(27,817)	303,873	303,873
2005	40	4.31	1.05379	546,654	0	(10,632)	(186,490)	(29,313)	320,219	320,219
2006	41	5.31	1.05179	574,964	0	(11,182)	(196,148)	(30,831)	336,802	336,802
2007	42	6.31	1.04979	603,589	0	(11,739)	(205,914)	(32,366)	353,570	353,570
2008	43	7.31	1.04779	632,433	0	(12,300)	(215,754)	(33,913)	370,466	370,466
2009	44	8.31	1.04579	661,395	0	(12,863)	(225,634)	(35,466)	387,431	387,431
2010	45	9.31	1.04380	690,367	0	(13,427)	(235,518)	(37,019)	404,403	404,403
2011	46	10.31	1.04182	719,236	0	(13,988)	(245,367)	(38,639)	423,242	423,242
2012	47	11.31	1.03984	747,887	0	(14,546)	(255,141)	(39,098)	440,102	440,102
2013	48	12.31	1.03786	776,199	0	(15,096)	(264,800)	(39,541)	456,763	456,763
2014	49	13.31	1.03588	804,051	0	(15,638)	(274,301)	(40,098)	473,412	473,412
2015	50	14.31	1.03391	831,316	0	(16,168)	(283,603)	(40,605)	490,003	490,003
2016	51	15.31	1.03194	857,871	0	(16,685)	(292,662)	(41,162)	506,544	506,544
2017	52	16.31	1.03000	883,607	0	(17,185)	(301,442)	(41,769)	523,076	523,076
2018	53	17.31	1.03000	910,115	0	(17,701)	(310,485)	(42,426)	539,608	539,608
2019	54	18.31	1.03000	937,418	0	(18,232)	(319,799)	(43,133)	556,153	556,153
2020	55	19.31	1.03000	965,541	0	(18,779)	(329,393)	(43,890)	572,751	572,751
2021	56	20.31	1.03000	994,507	0	(19,342)	(339,275)	(44,697)	589,385	589,385
2022	57	21.31	1.03000	1,024,342	0	(19,922)	(349,453)	(45,554)	606,065	606,065
2023	58	22.31	1.03000	1,055,073	0	(20,520)	(359,937)	(46,461)	622,794	622,794
2024	59	23.31	1.03000	1,086,725	0	(21,136)	(370,735)	(47,418)	639,552	639,552
2025	60	24.31	1.03000	1,119,327	0	(21,770)	(381,857)	(48,426)	656,331	656,331
2026	61	24.39	1.03000	96,076	0	(1,869)	(32,776)	(7,008)	54,423	40,053
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$19,127,637</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$369,400)</b>	<b>(\$6,526,792)</b>	<b>(\$1,219,099)</b>	<b>\$11,012,346</b>	<b>\$10,493,547</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	35.170%	8.53-11.60%	0.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. GEOFFREY W. CLOUD**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	36	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	37	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	38	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	39	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	40	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	41	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	42	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	43	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	44	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	45	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	46	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	47	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	48	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	49	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	50	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	51	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	52	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	53	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	54	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	55	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	56	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	57	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	58	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	59	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	60	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	61	25.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. GEOFFREY W. CLOUD**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	36	0.31	\$3,753	\$902	\$4,655	\$4,655
2002	37	1.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2003	38	2.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2004	39	3.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2005	40	4.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2006	41	5.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2007	42	6.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2008	43	7.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2009	44	8.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2010	45	9.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2011	46	10.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2012	47	11.31	12,240	2,940	15,180	15,180
2013	48	12.31	12,051	2,751	14,802	14,802
2014	49	13.31	7,932	2,604	10,536	10,536
2015	50	13.52	1,692	556	2,248	2,248
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$160,069</b>	<b>\$39,152</b>	<b>\$199,221</b>	<b>\$199,221</b>

# **Exhibit B-11**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Brenda E. Conway**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **April 17, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,690,663
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	270,256
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,960,919</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
73,490	3.0%	18.440%	4,804	8.89-17.36%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	40	0.31	1.00000	\$22,535	\$1,473	\$0	(\$4,155)	(\$1,634)	\$18,218	\$18,218
2002	41	1.31	1.05179	77,296	5,052	(2,015)	(13,826)	(7,192)	59,316	59,316
2003	42	2.31	1.04979	81,144	5,304	(2,115)	(14,514)	(7,550)	62,269	62,269
2004	43	3.31	1.04779	85,022	5,557	(2,216)	(15,208)	(7,911)	65,245	65,245
2005	44	4.31	1.04579	88,915	5,812	(2,318)	(15,904)	(8,273)	68,233	68,233
2006	45	5.31	1.04380	92,810	6,067	(2,419)	(16,601)	(8,635)	71,222	71,222
2007	46	6.31	1.04182	96,691	6,320	(2,520)	(17,295)	(8,996)	74,200	74,200
2008	47	7.31	1.03984	100,543	6,572	(2,621)	(17,984)	(13,809)	72,701	72,701
2009	48	8.31	1.03786	104,349	6,821	(2,720)	(18,665)	(14,332)	75,453	75,453
2010	49	9.31	1.03588	108,094	7,066	(2,818)	(19,334)	(14,846)	78,161	78,161
2011	50	10.31	1.03391	111,759	7,305	(2,913)	(19,990)	(15,350)	80,811	80,811
2012	51	11.31	1.03194	115,329	7,538	(3,006)	(20,629)	(15,840)	83,392	83,392
2013	52	12.31	1.03000	118,789	7,765	(3,097)	(21,248)	(16,315)	85,894	85,894
2014	53	13.31	1.03000	122,352	7,998	(3,189)	(21,885)	(16,805)	88,471	88,471
2015	54	14.31	1.03000	126,023	8,237	(3,285)	(22,541)	(17,309)	91,125	91,125
2016	55	15.31	1.03000	129,804	8,485	(3,384)	(23,218)	(17,828)	93,859	93,859
2017	56	16.31	1.03000	133,698	8,739	(3,485)	(23,914)	(18,363)	96,675	96,675
2018	57	17.31	1.03000	137,709	9,001	(3,590)	(24,632)	(18,914)	99,575	99,575
2019	58	18.31	1.03000	141,840	9,271	(3,697)	(25,371)	(19,481)	102,562	102,562
2020	59	19.31	1.03000	146,095	9,550	(3,808)	(26,132)	(20,066)	105,639	103,479
2021	60	20.31	1.03000	150,478	9,836	(3,923)	(26,916)	(20,668)	108,808	102,582
2022	61	20.47	1.03000	25,831	1,688	(673)	(4,620)	(3,548)	18,678	17,220
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,317,107</b>	<b>\$151,458</b>	<b>(\$59,813)</b>	<b>(\$414,581)</b>	<b>(\$293,662)</b>	<b>\$1,700,508</b>	<b>\$1,690,663</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	18.440%	8.89-17.36%	0.000%	2.039%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	40	0.31	\$0	\$460	\$0	(\$41)	\$419	\$419
2002	41	1.31	0	1,576	0	(185)	1,391	1,391
2003	42	2.31	0	1,605	0	(189)	1,416	1,416
2004	43	3.31	0	1,682	0	(198)	1,484	1,484
2005	44	4.31	0	1,759	0	(207)	1,552	1,552
2006	45	5.31	0	1,836	0	(216)	1,620	1,620
2007	46	6.31	0	1,912	0	(225)	1,688	1,688
2008	47	7.31	0	1,989	0	(345)	1,643	1,643
2009	48	8.31	0	2,064	0	(358)	1,706	1,706
2010	49	9.31	0	2,138	0	(371)	1,767	1,767
2011	50	10.31	0	2,210	0	(384)	1,827	1,827
2012	51	11.31	0	2,281	0	(396)	1,885	1,885
2013	52	12.31	0	2,349	0	(408)	1,942	1,942
2014	53	13.31	0	2,420	0	(420)	2,000	2,000
2015	54	14.31	0	2,493	0	(433)	2,060	2,060
2016	55	15.31	0	2,567	0	(446)	2,122	2,122
2017	56	16.31	0	2,644	0	(459)	2,185	2,185
2018	57	17.31	0	2,724	0	(473)	2,251	2,251
2019	58	18.31	0	2,805	0	(487)	2,318	2,318
2020	59	19.31	0	2,890	0	(502)	2,388	2,339
2021	60	20.31	0	2,976	0	(517)	2,460	2,319
2022	61	21.31	0	511	0	(89)	422	383
2023	62	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	63	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	64	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	65	25.31	33,820	0	(6,236)	(4,789)	22,795	17,749
2027	66	26.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	20,499
2028	67	27.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	19,730
2029	68	28.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	18,989
2030	69	29.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	18,276
2031	70	30.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	17,590
2032	71	31.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	16,930
2033	72	32.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	16,295
2034	73	33.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	15,683
2035	74	34.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	15,094
2036	75	35.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	14,528
2037	76	36.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	13,982
2038	77	37.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	13,458
2039	78	37.56	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	13,138
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$561,412</b>	<b>\$45,891</b>	<b>(\$103,524)</b>	<b>(\$86,840)</b>	<b>\$416,939</b>	<b>\$270,256</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	40	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	41	1.31			0	0
2003	42	2.31			0	0
2004	43	3.31			0	0
2005	44	4.31			0	0
2006	45	5.31			0	0
2007	46	6.31			0	0
2008	47	7.31			0	0
2009	48	8.31			0	0
2010	49	9.31			0	0
2011	50	10.31			0	0
2012	51	11.31			0	0
2013	52	12.31			0	0
2014	53	13.31			0	0
2015	54	14.31			0	0
2016	55	15.31			0	0
2017	56	16.31			0	0
2018	57	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-12**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Matthew Barnes**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **April 19, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. MATTHEW BARNES**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$3,658,658
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	922,974
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	269,146
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$4,850,778</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
93,360	3.0%	11.090%	7,631	12.486%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. MATTHEW BARNES**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	38	0.31	1.00000	\$28,628	\$2,340	\$0	(\$3,175)	(\$1,380)	\$26,414	\$26,414
2002	39	1.31	1.05580	98,570	8,057	(2,844)	(10,603)	(4,608)	88,572	88,572
2003	40	2.31	1.05379	103,872	8,490	(2,997)	(11,174)	(4,855)	93,336	93,336
2004	41	3.31	1.05179	109,252	8,930	(3,152)	(11,753)	(5,107)	98,170	98,170
2005	42	4.31	1.04979	114,691	9,375	(3,309)	(12,338)	(5,361)	103,057	103,057
2006	43	5.31	1.04779	120,172	9,823	(3,467)	(12,927)	(5,617)	107,982	107,982
2007	44	6.31	1.04579	125,675	10,272	(3,626)	(13,519)	(5,874)	112,927	112,927
2008	45	7.31	1.04380	131,180	10,722	(3,785)	(14,111)	(6,132)	117,874	117,874
2009	46	8.31	1.04182	136,665	11,171	(3,943)	(14,702)	(7,873)	121,318	121,318
2010	47	9.31	1.03984	142,110	11,616	(4,100)	(15,287)	(10,663)	123,675	123,675
2011	48	10.31	1.03786	147,489	12,056	(4,256)	(15,866)	(11,066)	128,357	128,357
2012	49	11.31	1.03588	152,781	12,488	(4,408)	(16,435)	(11,463)	132,963	132,963
2013	50	12.31	1.03391	157,962	12,912	(4,558)	(16,992)	(17,010)	132,313	132,313
2014	51	13.31	1.03194	163,008	13,324	(4,703)	(17,535)	(17,554)	136,540	136,540
2015	52	14.31	1.03000	167,898	13,724	(4,844)	(18,061)	(18,080)	140,636	140,636
2016	53	15.31	1.03000	172,935	14,135	(4,990)	(18,603)	(18,623)	144,855	144,855
2017	54	16.31	1.03000	178,123	14,559	(5,139)	(19,161)	(19,182)	149,201	149,201
2018	55	17.31	1.03000	183,467	14,996	(5,294)	(19,736)	(19,757)	153,677	153,677
2019	56	18.31	1.03000	188,971	15,446	(5,452)	(20,328)	(20,350)	158,287	158,287
2020	57	19.31	1.03000	194,640	15,910	(5,616)	(20,938)	(20,960)	163,035	159,701
2021	58	20.31	1.03000	200,479	16,387	(5,784)	(21,566)	(21,589)	167,927	158,318
2022	59	21.31	1.03000	206,494	16,878	(5,958)	(22,213)	(22,237)	172,964	156,947
2023	60	22.31	1.03000	212,689	17,385	(6,137)	(22,880)	(22,904)	178,153	155,587
2024	61	23.31	1.03000	219,069	17,906	(6,321)	(23,566)	(23,591)	183,498	154,239
2025	62	24.31	1.03000	225,641	18,444	(6,510)	(24,273)	(24,299)	189,003	152,903
2026	63	25.31	1.03000	232,411	18,997	(6,706)	(25,001)	(25,028)	194,673	151,579
2027	64	26.31	1.03000	239,383	19,567	(6,907)	(25,751)	(25,778)	200,513	150,266
2028	65	27.31	1.03000	246,564	20,154	(7,114)	(26,524)	(26,552)	206,528	148,964
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$4,600,820</b>	<b>\$376,063</b>	<b>(\$131,922)</b>	<b>(\$495,019)</b>	<b>(\$423,492)</b>	<b>\$3,926,449</b>	<b>\$3,658,658</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	12.486%	4.000%	5.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. MATTHEW BARNES**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	38	0.31	(\$451)		\$0	\$24	(\$426)	(\$426)
2002	39	1.31	(1,551)		0	84	(1,467)	(1,467)
2003	40	2.31	(1,634)		0	89	(1,546)	(1,546)
2004	41	3.31	(1,720)		0	93	(1,626)	(1,626)
2005	42	4.31	(1,805)		0	98	(1,707)	(1,707)
2006	43	5.31	(1,891)		0	103	(1,789)	(1,789)
2007	44	6.31	(1,978)		0	107	(1,871)	(1,871)
2008	45	7.31	(2,064)		0	112	(1,953)	(1,953)
2009	46	8.31	(2,151)		0	144	(2,008)	(2,008)
2010	47	9.31	(560)	(15,680)	3,387	1,118	(11,735)	(11,735)
2011	48	10.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	1,426	(14,965)	(14,965)
2012	49	11.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	1,426	(14,965)	(14,965)
2013	50	12.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	2,047	(14,344)	(14,344)
2014	51	13.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	2,047	(14,344)	(14,344)
2015	52	14.31	6,716	45,593	(9,848)	(5,302)	37,159	37,159
2016	53	15.31	7,037	67,760	(14,636)	(7,512)	52,649	52,649
2017	54	16.31	7,359	67,760	(14,636)	(7,552)	52,931	52,931
2018	55	17.31	7,681	67,760	(14,636)	(7,592)	53,213	53,213
2019	56	18.31	8,003	67,760	(14,636)	(7,633)	53,494	53,494
2020	57	19.31	8,322	67,580	(14,597)	(7,655)	53,649	52,552
2021	58	20.31	8,637	67,400	(14,558)	(7,676)	53,802	50,723
2022	59	21.31	8,946	67,220	(14,520)	(7,698)	53,949	48,953
2023	60	22.31	9,250	67,040	(14,481)	(7,718)	54,091	47,240
2024	61	23.31	9,545	66,860	(14,442)	(7,737)	54,226	45,580
2025	62	24.31	9,832	66,860	(14,442)	(7,773)	54,477	44,072
2026	63	25.31	10,127	66,860	(14,442)	(7,810)	54,735	42,619
2027	64	26.31	10,430	66,860	(14,442)	(7,848)	55,001	41,218
2028	65	27.31	10,743	66,860	(14,442)	(7,887)	55,275	39,868
2029	66	28.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	31,845
2030	67	29.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	30,650
2031	68	30.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	29,499
2032	69	31.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	28,392
2033	70	32.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	27,326
2034	71	33.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	26,301
2035	72	34.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	25,313
2036	73	35.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	24,363
2037	74	36.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	23,449
2038	75	37.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	22,569
2039	76	38.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	21,721
2040	77	39.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	20,906
2041	78	40.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	20,121
2042	79	40.97	0	44,573	(9,628)	(4,363)	30,582	12,993
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$106,822</b>	<b>\$1,734,618</b>	<b>(\$374,677)</b>	<b>(\$185,925)</b>	<b>\$1,280,837</b>	<b>\$922,974</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. MATTHEW BARNES**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	38	0.31	\$5,762	\$2,892	\$8,655	\$8,655
2002	39	1.31	18,792	9,432	28,224	28,224
2003	40	2.31	18,792	9,432	28,224	28,224
2004	41	3.31	18,792	9,432	28,224	28,224
2005	42	4.31	18,792	7,240	26,032	26,032
2006	43	5.31	18,792	5,844	24,636	24,636
2007	44	6.31	18,792	5,844	24,636	24,636
2008	45	7.31	19,181	5,524	24,705	24,705
2009	46	8.31	20,903	3,734	24,637	24,637
2010	47	9.31	18,180	1,944	20,124	20,124
2011	48	10.31	21,156	1,944	23,100	23,100
2012	49	10.69	7,204	745	7,949	7,949
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$205,138</b>	<b>\$64,008</b>	<b>\$269,146</b>	<b>\$269,146</b>

# **Exhibit B-13**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Brian Joseph Cachia**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 26, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,318,902
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	97,419
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,416,320</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
81,682	3.0%	18.440%	3,897	60.815%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	26	0.31	1.00000	\$25,047	\$1,195	\$0	(\$4,619)	(\$12,423)	\$9,200	\$9,200
2002	27	1.31	1.08021	88,234	4,210	(2,262)	(15,782)	(42,452)	31,948	31,948
2003	28	2.31	1.07816	95,130	4,539	(2,439)	(17,016)	(45,769)	34,445	34,445
2004	29	3.31	1.07611	102,370	4,884	(2,624)	(18,311)	(49,253)	37,066	37,066
2005	30	4.31	1.07406	109,951	5,246	(2,819)	(19,667)	(52,900)	39,811	39,811
2006	31	5.31	1.07201	117,869	5,624	(3,022)	(21,083)	(56,710)	42,678	42,678
2007	32	6.31	1.06997	126,117	6,017	(3,233)	(22,558)	(60,678)	45,665	45,665
2008	33	7.31	1.06794	134,685	6,426	(3,453)	(24,091)	(64,800)	48,767	48,767
2009	34	8.31	1.06591	143,561	6,849	(3,680)	(25,679)	(69,071)	51,981	51,981
2010	35	9.31	1.06388	152,732	7,287	(3,915)	(27,319)	(73,483)	55,302	55,302
2011	36	10.31	1.06185	162,178	7,738	(4,158)	(29,009)	(78,028)	58,722	58,722
2012	37	11.31	1.05983	171,882	8,201	(4,406)	(30,744)	(82,696)	62,235	62,235
2013	38	12.31	1.05781	181,819	8,675	(4,661)	(32,522)	(87,478)	65,834	65,834
2014	39	13.31	1.05580	191,965	9,159	(4,921)	(34,336)	(92,359)	69,507	69,507
2015	40	14.31	1.05379	202,291	9,651	(5,186)	(36,183)	(97,327)	73,246	73,246
2016	41	15.31	1.05179	212,767	10,151	(5,454)	(38,057)	(102,368)	77,039	77,039
2017	42	16.31	1.04979	223,360	10,657	(5,726)	(39,952)	(107,464)	80,875	80,875
2018	43	17.31	1.04779	234,034	11,166	(6,000)	(41,861)	(112,599)	84,740	84,740
2019	44	18.31	1.04579	244,752	11,677	(6,274)	(43,778)	(117,756)	88,620	88,620
2020	45	19.31	1.04380	255,473	12,189	(6,549)	(45,696)	(122,914)	92,502	90,470
2021	46	20.31	1.04182	266,156	12,698	(6,823)	(47,607)	(128,054)	96,370	90,454
2022	47	21.31	1.03984	276,758	13,204	(7,095)	(49,503)	(133,155)	100,209	90,266
2023	48	22.31	1.03786	287,235	13,704	(7,363)	(51,377)	(138,196)	104,003	89,907
2024	49	23.31	1.03588	297,542	14,196	(7,628)	(53,221)	(143,155)	107,735	89,379
2025	50	24.31	1.03391	307,632	14,677	(7,886)	(55,025)	(148,009)	111,388	88,685
2026	51	25.31	1.03194	317,458	15,146	(8,138)	(56,783)	(152,737)	114,946	87,829
2027	52	26.31	1.03000	326,982	15,600	(8,382)	(58,487)	(157,319)	118,395	86,818
2028	53	27.31	1.03000	336,791	16,068	(8,634)	(60,241)	(162,038)	121,946	85,818
2029	54	28.31	1.03000	346,895	16,550	(8,893)	(62,048)	(166,900)	125,605	84,830
2030	55	29.31	1.03000	357,302	17,047	(9,160)	(63,910)	(171,907)	129,373	83,853
2031	56	30.31	1.03000	368,021	17,558	(9,434)	(65,827)	(177,064)	133,254	82,887
2032	57	31.31	1.03000	379,062	18,085	(9,717)	(67,802)	(182,376)	137,252	81,933
2033	58	32.31	1.03000	390,433	18,628	(10,009)	(69,836)	(187,847)	141,369	80,989
2034	59	32.89	1.03000	234,586	11,192	(6,014)	(41,960)	(112,865)	84,939	47,099
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$7,669,071</b>	<b>\$365,894</b>	<b>(\$195,957)</b>	<b>(\$1,371,890)</b>	<b>(\$3,690,148)</b>	<b>\$2,776,970</b>	<b>\$2,318,902</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	60.815%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	26	0.31	\$1,002	\$0	\$0	(\$609)	\$393	\$393
2002	27	1.31	3,529	0	0	(2,146)	1,383	1,383
2003	28	2.31	3,691	0	0	(2,245)	1,446	1,446
2004	29	3.31	3,972	0	0	(2,416)	1,556	1,556
2005	30	4.31	4,266	0	0	(2,594)	1,672	1,672
2006	31	5.31	4,573	0	0	(2,781)	1,792	1,792
2007	32	6.31	4,893	0	0	(2,976)	1,917	1,917
2008	33	7.31	5,226	0	0	(3,178)	2,048	2,048
2009	34	8.31	5,570	0	0	(3,387)	2,183	2,183
2010	35	9.31	5,926	0	0	(3,604)	2,322	2,322
2011	36	10.31	6,293	0	0	(3,827)	2,466	2,466
2012	37	11.31	6,669	0	0	(4,056)	2,613	2,613
2013	38	12.31	7,055	0	0	(4,290)	2,764	2,764
2014	39	13.31	7,448	0	0	(4,530)	2,919	2,919
2015	40	14.31	7,849	0	0	(4,773)	3,076	3,076
2016	41	15.31	8,255	0	0	(5,020)	3,235	3,235
2017	42	16.31	8,666	0	0	(5,270)	3,396	3,396
2018	43	17.31	9,081	0	0	(5,522)	3,558	3,558
2019	44	18.31	9,496	0	0	(5,775)	3,721	3,721
2020	45	19.31	9,912	0	0	(6,028)	3,884	3,799
2021	46	20.31	10,327	0	0	(6,280)	4,047	3,798
2022	47	21.31	10,738	0	0	(6,530)	4,208	3,790
2023	48	22.31	11,145	0	0	(6,778)	4,367	3,775
2024	49	23.31	11,545	0	0	(7,021)	4,524	3,753
2025	50	24.31	11,936	0	0	(7,259)	4,677	3,724
2026	51	25.31	12,317	0	0	(7,491)	4,827	3,688
2027	52	26.31	12,687	0	0	(7,715)	4,971	3,646
2028	53	27.31	13,068	0	0	(7,947)	5,121	3,604
2029	54	28.31	13,460	0	0	(8,185)	5,274	3,562
2030	55	29.31	13,863	0	0	(8,431)	5,432	3,521
2031	56	30.31	14,279	0	0	(8,684)	5,595	3,480
2032	57	31.31	14,708	0	0	(8,944)	5,763	3,440
2033	58	32.31	15,149	0	0	(9,213)	5,936	3,401
2034	59	32.89	9,102	0	0	(5,535)	3,567	1,978
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$297,696</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$181,043)</b>	<b>\$116,653</b>	<b>\$97,419</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	26	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	27	1.31			0	0
2003	28	2.31			0	0
2004	29	3.31			0	0
2005	30	4.31			0	0
2006	31	5.31			0	0
2007	32	6.31			0	0
2008	33	7.31			0	0
2009	34	8.31			0	0
2010	35	9.31			0	0
2011	36	10.31			0	0
2012	37	11.31			0	0
2013	38	12.31			0	0
2014	39	13.31			0	0
2015	40	14.31			0	0
2016	41	15.31			0	0
2017	42	16.31			0	0
2018	43	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-11**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Brenda E. Conway**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **April 17, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,690,663
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	270,256
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,960,919</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
73,490	3.0%	18.440%	4,804	8.89-17.36%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	40	0.31	1.00000	\$22,535	\$1,473	\$0	(\$4,155)	(\$1,634)	\$18,218	\$18,218
2002	41	1.31	1.05179	77,296	5,052	(2,015)	(13,826)	(7,192)	59,316	59,316
2003	42	2.31	1.04979	81,144	5,304	(2,115)	(14,514)	(7,550)	62,269	62,269
2004	43	3.31	1.04779	85,022	5,557	(2,216)	(15,208)	(7,911)	65,245	65,245
2005	44	4.31	1.04579	88,915	5,812	(2,318)	(15,904)	(8,273)	68,233	68,233
2006	45	5.31	1.04380	92,810	6,067	(2,419)	(16,601)	(8,635)	71,222	71,222
2007	46	6.31	1.04182	96,691	6,320	(2,520)	(17,295)	(8,996)	74,200	74,200
2008	47	7.31	1.03984	100,543	6,572	(2,621)	(17,984)	(13,809)	72,701	72,701
2009	48	8.31	1.03786	104,349	6,821	(2,720)	(18,665)	(14,332)	75,453	75,453
2010	49	9.31	1.03588	108,094	7,066	(2,818)	(19,334)	(14,846)	78,161	78,161
2011	50	10.31	1.03391	111,759	7,305	(2,913)	(19,990)	(15,350)	80,811	80,811
2012	51	11.31	1.03194	115,329	7,538	(3,006)	(20,629)	(15,840)	83,392	83,392
2013	52	12.31	1.03000	118,789	7,765	(3,097)	(21,248)	(16,315)	85,894	85,894
2014	53	13.31	1.03000	122,352	7,998	(3,189)	(21,885)	(16,805)	88,471	88,471
2015	54	14.31	1.03000	126,023	8,237	(3,285)	(22,541)	(17,309)	91,125	91,125
2016	55	15.31	1.03000	129,804	8,485	(3,384)	(23,218)	(17,828)	93,859	93,859
2017	56	16.31	1.03000	133,698	8,739	(3,485)	(23,914)	(18,363)	96,675	96,675
2018	57	17.31	1.03000	137,709	9,001	(3,590)	(24,632)	(18,914)	99,575	99,575
2019	58	18.31	1.03000	141,840	9,271	(3,697)	(25,371)	(19,481)	102,562	102,562
2020	59	19.31	1.03000	146,095	9,550	(3,808)	(26,132)	(20,066)	105,639	103,479
2021	60	20.31	1.03000	150,478	9,836	(3,923)	(26,916)	(20,668)	108,808	102,582
2022	61	20.47	1.03000	25,831	1,688	(673)	(4,620)	(3,548)	18,678	17,220
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,317,107</b>	<b>\$151,458</b>	<b>(\$59,813)</b>	<b>(\$414,581)</b>	<b>(\$293,662)</b>	<b>\$1,700,508</b>	<b>\$1,690,663</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	18.440%	8.89-17.36%	0.000%	2.039%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	40	0.31	\$0	\$460	\$0	(\$41)	\$419	\$419
2002	41	1.31	0	1,576	0	(185)	1,391	1,391
2003	42	2.31	0	1,605	0	(189)	1,416	1,416
2004	43	3.31	0	1,682	0	(198)	1,484	1,484
2005	44	4.31	0	1,759	0	(207)	1,552	1,552
2006	45	5.31	0	1,836	0	(216)	1,620	1,620
2007	46	6.31	0	1,912	0	(225)	1,688	1,688
2008	47	7.31	0	1,989	0	(345)	1,643	1,643
2009	48	8.31	0	2,064	0	(358)	1,706	1,706
2010	49	9.31	0	2,138	0	(371)	1,767	1,767
2011	50	10.31	0	2,210	0	(384)	1,827	1,827
2012	51	11.31	0	2,281	0	(396)	1,885	1,885
2013	52	12.31	0	2,349	0	(408)	1,942	1,942
2014	53	13.31	0	2,420	0	(420)	2,000	2,000
2015	54	14.31	0	2,493	0	(433)	2,060	2,060
2016	55	15.31	0	2,567	0	(446)	2,122	2,122
2017	56	16.31	0	2,644	0	(459)	2,185	2,185
2018	57	17.31	0	2,724	0	(473)	2,251	2,251
2019	58	18.31	0	2,805	0	(487)	2,318	2,318
2020	59	19.31	0	2,890	0	(502)	2,388	2,339
2021	60	20.31	0	2,976	0	(517)	2,460	2,319
2022	61	21.31	0	511	0	(89)	422	383
2023	62	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	63	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	64	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	65	25.31	33,820	0	(6,236)	(4,789)	22,795	17,749
2027	66	26.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	20,499
2028	67	27.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	19,730
2029	68	28.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	18,989
2030	69	29.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	18,276
2031	70	30.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	17,590
2032	71	31.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	16,930
2033	72	32.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	16,295
2034	73	33.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	15,683
2035	74	34.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	15,094
2036	75	35.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	14,528
2037	76	36.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	13,982
2038	77	37.31	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	13,458
2039	78	37.56	40,584	0	(7,484)	(5,746)	27,354	13,138
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$561,412</b>	<b>\$45,891</b>	<b>(\$103,524)</b>	<b>(\$86,840)</b>	<b>\$416,939</b>	<b>\$270,256</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. BRENDA E. CONWAY**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	40	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	41	1.31			0	0
2003	42	2.31			0	0
2004	43	3.31			0	0
2005	44	4.31			0	0
2006	45	5.31			0	0
2007	46	6.31			0	0
2008	47	7.31			0	0
2009	48	8.31			0	0
2010	49	9.31			0	0
2011	50	10.31			0	0
2012	51	11.31			0	0
2013	52	12.31			0	0
2014	53	13.31			0	0
2015	54	14.31			0	0
2016	55	15.31			0	0
2017	56	16.31			0	0
2018	57	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-12**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Matthew Barnes**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **April 19, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. MATTHEW BARNES**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$3,658,658
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	922,974
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	269,146
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$4,850,778</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
93,360	3.0%	11.090%	7,631	12.486%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. MATTHEW BARNES**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	38	0.31	1.00000	\$28,628	\$2,340	\$0	(\$3,175)	(\$1,380)	\$26,414	\$26,414
2002	39	1.31	1.05580	98,570	8,057	(2,844)	(10,603)	(4,608)	88,572	88,572
2003	40	2.31	1.05379	103,872	8,490	(2,997)	(11,174)	(4,855)	93,336	93,336
2004	41	3.31	1.05179	109,252	8,930	(3,152)	(11,753)	(5,107)	98,170	98,170
2005	42	4.31	1.04979	114,691	9,375	(3,309)	(12,338)	(5,361)	103,057	103,057
2006	43	5.31	1.04779	120,172	9,823	(3,467)	(12,927)	(5,617)	107,982	107,982
2007	44	6.31	1.04579	125,675	10,272	(3,626)	(13,519)	(5,874)	112,927	112,927
2008	45	7.31	1.04380	131,180	10,722	(3,785)	(14,111)	(6,132)	117,874	117,874
2009	46	8.31	1.04182	136,665	11,171	(3,943)	(14,702)	(7,873)	121,318	121,318
2010	47	9.31	1.03984	142,110	11,616	(4,100)	(15,287)	(10,663)	123,675	123,675
2011	48	10.31	1.03786	147,489	12,056	(4,256)	(15,866)	(11,066)	128,357	128,357
2012	49	11.31	1.03588	152,781	12,488	(4,408)	(16,435)	(11,463)	132,963	132,963
2013	50	12.31	1.03391	157,962	12,912	(4,558)	(16,992)	(17,010)	132,313	132,313
2014	51	13.31	1.03194	163,008	13,324	(4,703)	(17,535)	(17,554)	136,540	136,540
2015	52	14.31	1.03000	167,898	13,724	(4,844)	(18,061)	(18,080)	140,636	140,636
2016	53	15.31	1.03000	172,935	14,135	(4,990)	(18,603)	(18,623)	144,855	144,855
2017	54	16.31	1.03000	178,123	14,559	(5,139)	(19,161)	(19,182)	149,201	149,201
2018	55	17.31	1.03000	183,467	14,996	(5,294)	(19,736)	(19,757)	153,677	153,677
2019	56	18.31	1.03000	188,971	15,446	(5,452)	(20,328)	(20,350)	158,287	158,287
2020	57	19.31	1.03000	194,640	15,910	(5,616)	(20,938)	(20,960)	163,035	159,701
2021	58	20.31	1.03000	200,479	16,387	(5,784)	(21,566)	(21,589)	167,927	158,318
2022	59	21.31	1.03000	206,494	16,878	(5,958)	(22,213)	(22,237)	172,964	156,947
2023	60	22.31	1.03000	212,689	17,385	(6,137)	(22,880)	(22,904)	178,153	155,587
2024	61	23.31	1.03000	219,069	17,906	(6,321)	(23,566)	(23,591)	183,498	154,239
2025	62	24.31	1.03000	225,641	18,444	(6,510)	(24,273)	(24,299)	189,003	152,903
2026	63	25.31	1.03000	232,411	18,997	(6,706)	(25,001)	(25,028)	194,673	151,579
2027	64	26.31	1.03000	239,383	19,567	(6,907)	(25,751)	(25,778)	200,513	150,266
2028	65	27.31	1.03000	246,564	20,154	(7,114)	(26,524)	(26,552)	206,528	148,964
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$4,600,820</b>	<b>\$376,063</b>	<b>(\$131,922)</b>	<b>(\$495,019)</b>	<b>(\$423,492)</b>	<b>\$3,926,449</b>	<b>\$3,658,658</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	12.486%	4.000%	5.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. MATTHEW BARNES**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	38	0.31	(\$451)		\$0	\$24	(\$426)	(\$426)
2002	39	1.31	(1,551)		0	84	(1,467)	(1,467)
2003	40	2.31	(1,634)		0	89	(1,546)	(1,546)
2004	41	3.31	(1,720)		0	93	(1,626)	(1,626)
2005	42	4.31	(1,805)		0	98	(1,707)	(1,707)
2006	43	5.31	(1,891)		0	103	(1,789)	(1,789)
2007	44	6.31	(1,978)		0	107	(1,871)	(1,871)
2008	45	7.31	(2,064)		0	112	(1,953)	(1,953)
2009	46	8.31	(2,151)		0	144	(2,008)	(2,008)
2010	47	9.31	(560)	(15,680)	3,387	1,118	(11,735)	(11,735)
2011	48	10.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	1,426	(14,965)	(14,965)
2012	49	11.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	1,426	(14,965)	(14,965)
2013	50	12.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	2,047	(14,344)	(14,344)
2014	51	13.31	0	(20,907)	4,516	2,047	(14,344)	(14,344)
2015	52	14.31	6,716	45,593	(9,848)	(5,302)	37,159	37,159
2016	53	15.31	7,037	67,760	(14,636)	(7,512)	52,649	52,649
2017	54	16.31	7,359	67,760	(14,636)	(7,552)	52,931	52,931
2018	55	17.31	7,681	67,760	(14,636)	(7,592)	53,213	53,213
2019	56	18.31	8,003	67,760	(14,636)	(7,633)	53,494	53,494
2020	57	19.31	8,322	67,580	(14,597)	(7,655)	53,649	52,552
2021	58	20.31	8,637	67,400	(14,558)	(7,676)	53,802	50,723
2022	59	21.31	8,946	67,220	(14,520)	(7,698)	53,949	48,953
2023	60	22.31	9,250	67,040	(14,481)	(7,718)	54,091	47,240
2024	61	23.31	9,545	66,860	(14,442)	(7,737)	54,226	45,580
2025	62	24.31	9,832	66,860	(14,442)	(7,773)	54,477	44,072
2026	63	25.31	10,127	66,860	(14,442)	(7,810)	54,735	42,619
2027	64	26.31	10,430	66,860	(14,442)	(7,848)	55,001	41,218
2028	65	27.31	10,743	66,860	(14,442)	(7,887)	55,275	39,868
2029	66	28.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	31,845
2030	67	29.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	30,650
2031	68	30.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	29,499
2032	69	31.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	28,392
2033	70	32.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	27,326
2034	71	33.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	26,301
2035	72	34.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	25,313
2036	73	35.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	24,363
2037	74	36.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	23,449
2038	75	37.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	22,569
2039	76	38.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	21,721
2040	77	39.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	20,906
2041	78	40.31	0	66,860	(14,442)	(6,545)	45,873	20,121
2042	79	40.97	0	44,573	(9,628)	(4,363)	30,582	12,993
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$106,822</b>	<b>\$1,734,618</b>	<b>(\$374,677)</b>	<b>(\$185,925)</b>	<b>\$1,280,837</b>	<b>\$922,974</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. MATTHEW BARNES**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	38	0.31	\$5,762	\$2,892	\$8,655	\$8,655
2002	39	1.31	18,792	9,432	28,224	28,224
2003	40	2.31	18,792	9,432	28,224	28,224
2004	41	3.31	18,792	9,432	28,224	28,224
2005	42	4.31	18,792	7,240	26,032	26,032
2006	43	5.31	18,792	5,844	24,636	24,636
2007	44	6.31	18,792	5,844	24,636	24,636
2008	45	7.31	19,181	5,524	24,705	24,705
2009	46	8.31	20,903	3,734	24,637	24,637
2010	47	9.31	18,180	1,944	20,124	20,124
2011	48	10.31	21,156	1,944	23,100	23,100
2012	49	10.69	7,204	745	7,949	7,949
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$205,138</b>	<b>\$64,008</b>	<b>\$269,146</b>	<b>\$269,146</b>



# **Exhibit B-13**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Brian Joseph Cachia**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 26, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,318,902
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	97,419
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,416,320</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
81,682	3.0%	18.440%	3,897	60.815%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	26	0.31	1.00000	\$25,047	\$1,195	\$0	(\$4,619)	(\$12,423)	\$9,200	\$9,200
2002	27	1.31	1.08021	88,234	4,210	(2,262)	(15,782)	(42,452)	31,948	31,948
2003	28	2.31	1.07816	95,130	4,539	(2,439)	(17,016)	(45,769)	34,445	34,445
2004	29	3.31	1.07611	102,370	4,884	(2,624)	(18,311)	(49,253)	37,066	37,066
2005	30	4.31	1.07406	109,951	5,246	(2,819)	(19,667)	(52,900)	39,811	39,811
2006	31	5.31	1.07201	117,869	5,624	(3,022)	(21,083)	(56,710)	42,678	42,678
2007	32	6.31	1.06997	126,117	6,017	(3,233)	(22,558)	(60,678)	45,665	45,665
2008	33	7.31	1.06794	134,685	6,426	(3,453)	(24,091)	(64,800)	48,767	48,767
2009	34	8.31	1.06591	143,561	6,849	(3,680)	(25,679)	(69,071)	51,981	51,981
2010	35	9.31	1.06388	152,732	7,287	(3,915)	(27,319)	(73,483)	55,302	55,302
2011	36	10.31	1.06185	162,178	7,738	(4,158)	(29,009)	(78,028)	58,722	58,722
2012	37	11.31	1.05983	171,882	8,201	(4,406)	(30,744)	(82,696)	62,235	62,235
2013	38	12.31	1.05781	181,819	8,675	(4,661)	(32,522)	(87,478)	65,834	65,834
2014	39	13.31	1.05580	191,965	9,159	(4,921)	(34,336)	(92,359)	69,507	69,507
2015	40	14.31	1.05379	202,291	9,651	(5,186)	(36,183)	(97,327)	73,246	73,246
2016	41	15.31	1.05179	212,767	10,151	(5,454)	(38,057)	(102,368)	77,039	77,039
2017	42	16.31	1.04979	223,360	10,657	(5,726)	(39,952)	(107,464)	80,875	80,875
2018	43	17.31	1.04779	234,034	11,166	(6,000)	(41,861)	(112,599)	84,740	84,740
2019	44	18.31	1.04579	244,752	11,677	(6,274)	(43,778)	(117,756)	88,620	88,620
2020	45	19.31	1.04380	255,473	12,189	(6,549)	(45,696)	(122,914)	92,502	90,470
2021	46	20.31	1.04182	266,156	12,698	(6,823)	(47,607)	(128,054)	96,370	90,454
2022	47	21.31	1.03984	276,758	13,204	(7,095)	(49,503)	(133,155)	100,209	90,266
2023	48	22.31	1.03786	287,235	13,704	(7,363)	(51,377)	(138,196)	104,003	89,907
2024	49	23.31	1.03588	297,542	14,196	(7,628)	(53,221)	(143,155)	107,735	89,379
2025	50	24.31	1.03391	307,632	14,677	(7,886)	(55,025)	(148,009)	111,388	88,685
2026	51	25.31	1.03194	317,458	15,146	(8,138)	(56,783)	(152,737)	114,946	87,829
2027	52	26.31	1.03000	326,982	15,600	(8,382)	(58,487)	(157,319)	118,395	86,818
2028	53	27.31	1.03000	336,791	16,068	(8,634)	(60,241)	(162,038)	121,946	85,818
2029	54	28.31	1.03000	346,895	16,550	(8,893)	(62,048)	(166,900)	125,605	84,830
2030	55	29.31	1.03000	357,302	17,047	(9,160)	(63,910)	(171,907)	129,373	83,853
2031	56	30.31	1.03000	368,021	17,558	(9,434)	(65,827)	(177,064)	133,254	82,887
2032	57	31.31	1.03000	379,062	18,085	(9,717)	(67,802)	(182,376)	137,252	81,933
2033	58	32.31	1.03000	390,433	18,628	(10,009)	(69,836)	(187,847)	141,369	80,989
2034	59	32.89	1.03000	234,586	11,192	(6,014)	(41,960)	(112,865)	84,939	47,099
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$7,669,071</b>	<b>\$365,894</b>	<b>(\$195,957)</b>	<b>(\$1,371,890)</b>	<b>(\$3,690,148)</b>	<b>\$2,776,970</b>	<b>\$2,318,902</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	60.815%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	26	0.31	\$1,002	\$0	\$0	(\$609)	\$393	\$393
2002	27	1.31	3,529	0	0	(2,146)	1,383	1,383
2003	28	2.31	3,691	0	0	(2,245)	1,446	1,446
2004	29	3.31	3,972	0	0	(2,416)	1,556	1,556
2005	30	4.31	4,266	0	0	(2,594)	1,672	1,672
2006	31	5.31	4,573	0	0	(2,781)	1,792	1,792
2007	32	6.31	4,893	0	0	(2,976)	1,917	1,917
2008	33	7.31	5,226	0	0	(3,178)	2,048	2,048
2009	34	8.31	5,570	0	0	(3,387)	2,183	2,183
2010	35	9.31	5,926	0	0	(3,604)	2,322	2,322
2011	36	10.31	6,293	0	0	(3,827)	2,466	2,466
2012	37	11.31	6,669	0	0	(4,056)	2,613	2,613
2013	38	12.31	7,055	0	0	(4,290)	2,764	2,764
2014	39	13.31	7,448	0	0	(4,530)	2,919	2,919
2015	40	14.31	7,849	0	0	(4,773)	3,076	3,076
2016	41	15.31	8,255	0	0	(5,020)	3,235	3,235
2017	42	16.31	8,666	0	0	(5,270)	3,396	3,396
2018	43	17.31	9,081	0	0	(5,522)	3,558	3,558
2019	44	18.31	9,496	0	0	(5,775)	3,721	3,721
2020	45	19.31	9,912	0	0	(6,028)	3,884	3,799
2021	46	20.31	10,327	0	0	(6,280)	4,047	3,798
2022	47	21.31	10,738	0	0	(6,530)	4,208	3,790
2023	48	22.31	11,145	0	0	(6,778)	4,367	3,775
2024	49	23.31	11,545	0	0	(7,021)	4,524	3,753
2025	50	24.31	11,936	0	0	(7,259)	4,677	3,724
2026	51	25.31	12,317	0	0	(7,491)	4,827	3,688
2027	52	26.31	12,687	0	0	(7,715)	4,971	3,646
2028	53	27.31	13,068	0	0	(7,947)	5,121	3,604
2029	54	28.31	13,460	0	0	(8,185)	5,274	3,562
2030	55	29.31	13,863	0	0	(8,431)	5,432	3,521
2031	56	30.31	14,279	0	0	(8,684)	5,595	3,480
2032	57	31.31	14,708	0	0	(8,944)	5,763	3,440
2033	58	32.31	15,149	0	0	(9,213)	5,936	3,401
2034	59	32.89	9,102	0	0	(5,535)	3,567	1,978
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$297,696</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$181,043)</b>	<b>\$116,653</b>	<b>\$97,419</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. BRIAN JOSEPH CACHIA**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	26	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	27	1.31			0	0
2003	28	2.31			0	0
2004	29	3.31			0	0
2005	30	4.31			0	0
2006	31	5.31			0	0
2007	32	6.31			0	0
2008	33	7.31			0	0
2009	34	8.31			0	0
2010	35	9.31			0	0
2011	36	10.31			0	0
2012	37	11.31			0	0
2013	38	12.31			0	0
2014	39	13.31			0	0
2015	40	14.31			0	0
2016	41	15.31			0	0
2017	42	16.31			0	0
2018	43	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-14**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Benjamin Clark**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 26, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. BENJAMIN CLARK**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,676,613
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	67,281
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	535,986
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,279,881</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
45,529	3.0%	6.980%	2,443	6.27-22.78%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. BENJAMIN CLARK**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	39	0.31	1.00000	\$13,961	\$749	\$0	(\$974)	(\$815)	\$12,921	\$12,921
2002	40	1.31	1.05379	47,978	2,574	(1,411)	(3,248)	(2,715)	43,178	43,178
2003	41	2.31	1.05179	50,463	2,707	(1,484)	(3,417)	(2,856)	45,414	45,414
2004	42	3.31	1.04979	52,975	2,842	(1,558)	(3,587)	(3,506)	47,166	47,166
2005	43	4.31	1.04779	55,507	2,978	(1,632)	(3,758)	(4,424)	48,671	48,671
2006	44	5.31	1.04579	58,049	3,114	(1,707)	(3,930)	(4,626)	50,900	50,900
2007	45	6.31	1.04380	60,591	3,251	(1,782)	(4,102)	(4,829)	53,129	53,129
2008	46	7.31	1.04182	63,125	3,387	(1,856)	(4,274)	(5,031)	55,351	55,351
2009	47	8.31	1.03984	65,640	3,522	(1,930)	(4,444)	(5,231)	57,556	57,556
2010	48	9.31	1.03786	68,125	3,655	(2,003)	(4,612)	(5,429)	59,735	59,735
2011	49	10.31	1.03588	70,569	3,786	(2,075)	(4,778)	(7,066)	60,436	60,436
2012	50	11.31	1.03391	72,962	3,914	(2,145)	(4,940)	(7,306)	62,485	62,485
2013	51	12.31	1.03194	75,293	4,039	(2,214)	(5,098)	(10,139)	61,882	61,882
2014	52	13.31	1.03000	77,551	4,161	(2,280)	(5,251)	(10,443)	63,738	63,738
2015	53	14.31	1.03000	79,878	4,285	(2,349)	(5,408)	(10,756)	65,650	65,650
2016	54	15.31	1.03000	82,274	4,414	(2,419)	(5,570)	(11,079)	67,620	67,620
2017	55	16.31	1.03000	84,742	4,546	(2,492)	(5,738)	(17,417)	63,642	63,642
2018	56	17.31	1.03000	87,285	4,683	(2,566)	(5,910)	(17,940)	65,552	65,552
2019	57	18.31	1.03000	89,903	4,823	(2,643)	(6,087)	(18,478)	67,518	67,518
2020	58	19.31	1.03000	92,600	4,968	(2,723)	(6,270)	(19,032)	69,544	68,121
2021	59	20.31	1.03000	95,378	5,117	(2,804)	(6,458)	(19,603)	71,630	67,531
2022	60	21.31	1.03000	98,240	5,271	(2,889)	(6,651)	(20,191)	73,779	66,946
2023	61	22.31	1.03000	101,187	5,429	(2,975)	(6,851)	(20,797)	75,992	66,367
2024	62	23.31	1.03000	104,223	5,591	(3,064)	(7,056)	(21,421)	78,272	65,792
2025	63	24.31	1.03000	107,349	5,759	(3,156)	(7,268)	(22,064)	80,620	65,222
2026	64	25.31	1.03000	110,570	5,932	(3,251)	(7,486)	(22,726)	83,039	64,657
2027	65	26.31	1.03000	113,887	6,110	(3,349)	(7,711)	(23,407)	85,530	64,097
2028	66	27.31	1.03000	117,303	6,293	(3,449)	(7,942)	(24,110)	88,096	63,541
2029	67	27.81	1.03000	60,412	3,241	(1,776)	(4,090)	(12,417)	45,370	31,797
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,258,019</b>	<b>\$121,141</b>	<b>(\$65,982)</b>	<b>(\$152,911)</b>	<b>(\$355,854)</b>	<b>\$1,804,414</b>	<b>\$1,676,613</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	6.980%	6.27-22.78%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS****MR. BENJAMIN CLARK**

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	39	0.31	\$558	\$0	\$0	(\$35)	\$523	\$523
2002	40	1.31	1,919	0	0	(120)	1,799	1,799
2003	41	2.31	1,958	0	0	(123)	1,835	1,835
2004	42	3.31	2,055	0	0	(151)	1,905	1,905
2005	43	4.31	2,154	0	0	(190)	1,963	1,963
2006	44	5.31	2,252	0	0	(199)	2,053	2,053
2007	45	6.31	2,351	0	0	(208)	2,143	2,143
2008	46	7.31	2,449	0	0	(216)	2,233	2,233
2009	47	8.31	2,547	0	0	(225)	2,322	2,322
2010	48	9.31	2,643	0	0	(233)	2,410	2,410
2011	49	10.31	2,738	0	0	(304)	2,434	2,434
2012	50	11.31	2,831	0	0	(314)	2,517	2,517
2013	51	12.31	2,921	0	0	(436)	2,485	2,485
2014	52	13.31	3,009	0	0	(449)	2,560	2,560
2015	53	14.31	3,099	0	0	(463)	2,637	2,637
2016	54	15.31	3,192	0	0	(476)	2,716	2,716
2017	55	16.31	3,288	0	0	(749)	2,539	2,539
2018	56	17.31	3,387	0	0	(771)	2,615	2,615
2019	57	18.31	3,488	0	0	(795)	2,694	2,694
2020	58	19.31	3,593	0	0	(818)	2,774	2,718
2021	59	20.31	3,701	0	0	(843)	2,858	2,694
2022	60	21.31	3,812	0	0	(868)	2,943	2,671
2023	61	22.31	3,926	0	0	(894)	3,032	2,648
2024	62	23.31	4,044	0	0	(921)	3,123	2,625
2025	63	24.31	4,165	0	0	(949)	3,216	2,602
2026	64	25.31	4,290	0	0	(977)	3,313	2,580
2027	65	26.31	4,419	0	0	(1,007)	3,412	2,557
2028	66	27.31	4,551	0	0	(1,037)	3,515	2,535
2029	67	27.81	2,344	0	0	(534)	1,810	1,269
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$87,685</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$15,306)</b>	<b>\$72,380</b>	<b>\$67,281</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. BENJAMIN CLARK**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	PRIOR MEDICAL COSTS	SPEECH THERAPY	FUTURE VISION CARE	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	39	0.31	\$2,922	\$4,784	\$931			\$8,636	\$8,636
2002	40	1.31	9,528	15,600				25,128	25,128
2003	41	2.31	9,528	15,600		588	219	25,934	25,934
2004	42	3.31	9,528	15,600		3,900	1,452	30,480	30,480
2005	43	4.31	9,528	15,600		3,900	1,452	30,480	30,480
2006	44	5.31	9,528	15,600		3,900	1,452	30,480	30,480
2007	45	6.31	9,528	15,600		3,900	1,452	30,480	30,480
2008	46	7.31	9,528	15,600		3,900	1,452	30,480	30,480
2009	47	8.31	9,528	15,600		3,900	1,452	30,480	30,480
2010	48	9.31	14,220	7,916		3,900	1,452	27,487	27,487
2011	49	10.31	16,080	4,980		3,900	1,452	26,412	26,412
2012	50	11.31	15,966	4,912		3,900	1,452	26,230	26,230
2013	51	12.31	13,776	3,600		3,900	1,452	22,728	22,728
2014	52	13.31	13,776	3,600		3,900	1,452	22,728	22,728
2015	53	14.31	13,776	3,600		3,900	1,452	22,728	22,728
2016	54	15.31	8,921	1,939		951	354	12,166	12,166
2017	55	16.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	8,760
2018	56	17.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	8,760
2019	57	18.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	8,760
2020	58	19.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	8,581
2021	59	20.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	8,259
2022	60	21.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	7,949
2023	61	22.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	7,650
2024	62	23.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	7,363
2025	63	24.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	7,087
2026	64	25.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	6,821
2027	65	26.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	6,565
2028	66	27.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	6,318
2029	67	28.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	6,081
2030	68	29.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	5,853
2031	69	30.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	5,633
2032	70	31.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	5,422
2033	71	32.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	5,218
2034	72	33.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	5,022
2035	73	34.31	7,356	1,404				8,760	4,834
2036	74	34.73	3,114	594				3,709	1,991
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$318,540</b>	<b>\$187,401</b>	<b>\$931</b>	<b>\$48,339</b>	<b>\$17,997</b>	<b>\$573,207</b>	<b>\$535,986</b>

# **Exhibit B-15**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Florence Day**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **October 8, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

<b>Valuation Date</b>	01-Jan-20
<b>Discount Rate</b>	3.4%

**Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages**  
**Mrs. Florence Day**

	<b>Present Value</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$78,787
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	0
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$78,787</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
37,666	3.0%	14.030%	3,255	68.034%

**Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings**  
**Mrs. Florence Day**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	62	0.31	1.00000	\$11,550	\$998	\$0	(\$1,620)	(\$6,756)	\$4,172	\$4,172
2002	63	1.31	1.03000	38,796	3,385	(1,088)	(5,280)	(22,011)	13,803	13,803
2003	64	2.31	1.03000	39,960	3,487	(1,121)	(5,438)	(22,671)	14,217	14,217
2004	65	3.31	1.03000	41,159	3,591	(1,154)	(5,601)	(23,351)	14,643	14,643
2005	66	4.31	1.03000	42,394	3,699	(1,189)	(5,769)	(24,052)	15,083	15,083
2006	67	5.31	1.03000	43,666	3,810	(1,224)	(5,942)	(24,773)	15,535	15,535
2007	68	5.39	1.03000	3,748	327	(105)	(510)	(2,126)	1,334	1,334
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$221,273</b>	<b>\$19,297</b>	<b>(\$5,881)</b>	<b>(\$30,162)</b>	<b>(\$125,741)</b>	<b>\$78,787</b>	<b>\$78,787</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	14.030%	68.034%	0.000%	0.000%

**Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits**  
**Mrs. Florence Day**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension	401(k)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	62	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	63	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	64	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	65	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	66	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	67	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	68	5.39	0	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

**Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**  
**Mrs. Florence Day**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Time Frame</b>	<b>Household Services</b>	<b>Care Services</b>	<b>Total Services</b>	<b>Present Value</b>
2001	62	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	63	1.31			0	0
2003	64	2.31			0	0
2004	65	3.31			0	0
2005	66	4.31			0	0
2006	67	5.31			0	0
2007	68	6.31			0	0
2008	69	7.31			0	0
2009	70	8.31			0	0
2010	71	9.31			0	0
2011	72	10.31			0	0
2012	73	11.31			0	0
2013	74	12.31			0	0
2014	75	13.31			0	0
2015	76	14.31			0	0
2016	77	15.31			0	0
2017	78	16.31			0	0
2018	79	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-16**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Janet M. Alonso**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **February 26, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. JANET M. ALONSO**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,097,871
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	426,972
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	1,845,984
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$4,370,828</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
69,759	3.0%	17.270%	8,088	9.120%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. JANET M. ALONSO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	41	0.31	1.00000	\$21,391	\$2,480	\$0	(\$3,694)	(\$1,614)	\$18,563	\$18,563
2002	42	1.31	1.05580	73,654	8,539	(2,040)	(12,338)	(5,390)	62,424	62,424
2003	43	2.31	1.05379	77,614	8,998	(2,150)	(13,002)	(5,680)	65,781	65,781
2004	44	3.31	1.05179	81,633	9,464	(2,261)	(13,675)	(5,974)	69,187	69,187
2005	45	4.31	1.04979	85,698	9,935	(2,374)	(14,356)	(6,272)	72,632	72,632
2006	46	5.31	1.04779	89,793	10,410	(2,487)	(15,042)	(6,572)	76,103	76,103
2007	47	6.31	1.04579	93,905	10,887	(2,601)	(15,731)	(6,873)	79,588	79,588
2008	48	7.31	1.04380	98,018	11,364	(2,715)	(16,420)	(7,174)	83,074	83,074
2009	49	8.31	1.04182	102,117	11,839	(2,828)	(17,107)	(7,474)	86,548	86,548
2010	50	9.31	1.03984	106,185	12,311	(2,941)	(17,788)	(7,771)	89,996	89,996
2011	51	10.31	1.03786	110,205	12,777	(3,052)	(18,461)	(8,065)	93,402	93,402
2012	52	11.31	1.03588	114,159	13,235	(3,162)	(19,124)	(8,355)	96,754	96,754
2013	53	12.31	1.03000	117,584	13,632	(3,257)	(19,698)	(8,606)	99,656	99,656
2014	54	13.31	1.03000	121,111	14,041	(3,354)	(20,288)	(8,864)	102,646	102,646
2015	55	14.31	1.03000	124,745	14,462	(3,455)	(20,897)	(9,130)	105,726	105,726
2016	56	15.31	1.03000	128,487	14,896	(3,559)	(21,524)	(9,403)	108,897	108,897
2017	57	16.31	1.03000	132,342	15,343	(3,665)	(22,170)	(9,686)	112,164	112,164
2018	58	17.31	1.03000	136,312	15,804	(3,775)	(22,835)	(9,976)	115,529	115,529
2019	59	18.31	1.03000	140,401	16,278	(3,889)	(23,520)	(10,275)	118,995	118,995
2020	60	19.31	1.03000	144,613	16,766	(4,005)	(24,225)	(10,584)	122,565	120,058
2021	61	20.31	1.03000	148,952	17,269	(4,125)	(24,952)	(10,901)	126,242	119,018
2022	62	21.31	1.03000	153,420	17,787	(4,249)	(25,701)	(11,228)	130,029	117,987
2023	63	21.97	1.03000	105,348	12,214	(2,918)	(12,334)	(7,710)	94,600	83,143
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,507,688</b>	<b>\$290,733</b>	<b>(\$68,862)</b>	<b>(\$414,883)</b>	<b>(\$183,577)</b>	<b>\$2,131,100</b>	<b>\$2,097,871</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	17.270%	9.120%	0.000%	4.760%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. JANET M. ALONSO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION (PROJ. MINUS VESTED)	401(K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	41	0.31	\$0	\$842	\$0	(\$77)	\$766	\$766
2002	42	1.31	0	2,900	0	(265)	2,636	2,636
2003	43	2.31	0	2,965	0	(270)	2,694	2,694
2004	44	3.31	0	3,118	0	(284)	2,834	2,834
2005	45	4.31	0	3,273	0	(299)	2,975	2,975
2006	46	5.31	0	3,430	0	(313)	3,117	3,117
2007	47	6.31	0	3,587	0	(327)	3,260	3,260
2008	48	7.31	0	3,744	0	(341)	3,403	3,403
2009	49	8.31	0	3,901	0	(356)	3,545	3,545
2010	50	9.31	0	4,056	0	(370)	3,686	3,686
2011	51	10.31	0	4,210	0	(384)	3,826	3,826
2012	52	11.31	0	4,361	0	(398)	3,963	3,963
2013	53	12.31	0	4,491	0	(410)	4,082	4,082
2014	54	13.31	0	4,626	0	(422)	4,204	4,204
2015	55	14.31	0	4,765	0	(435)	4,330	4,330
2016	56	15.31	0	4,908	0	(448)	4,460	4,460
2017	57	16.31	0	5,055	0	(461)	4,594	4,594
2018	58	17.31	0	5,207	0	(475)	4,732	4,732
2019	59	18.31	0	5,363	0	(489)	4,874	4,874
2020	60	19.31	0	5,524	0	(504)	5,020	4,918
2021	61	20.31	0	5,690	0	(519)	5,171	4,875
2022	62	21.31	0	5,860	0	(534)	5,326	4,833
2023	63	22.31	0	4,024	0	(367)	3,657	3,194
2024	64	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	65	24.31	17,512	0	(3,024)	(1,321)	13,166	10,652
2026	66	25.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	30,755
2027	67	26.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	29,601
2028	68	27.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	28,490
2029	69	28.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	27,420
2030	70	29.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	26,391
2031	71	30.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	25,401
2032	72	31.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	24,447
2033	73	32.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	23,529
2034	74	33.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	22,646
2035	75	34.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	21,796
2036	76	35.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	20,978
2037	77	36.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	20,191
2038	78	37.31	52,536	0	(9,073)	(3,964)	39,499	19,433
2039	79	37.81	26,268	0	(4,536)	(1,982)	19,750	9,441
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$726,748</b>	<b>\$95,901</b>	<b>(\$125,509)</b>	<b>(\$63,579)</b>	<b>\$633,561</b>	<b>\$426,972</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. JANET M. ALONSO**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	CARE COSTS FOR DOWN'S CHILD	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	41	0.31	\$5,196	\$1,575	\$13,552	\$20,323	\$20,323
2002	42	1.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2003	43	2.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2004	44	3.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2005	45	4.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2006	46	5.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2007	47	6.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2008	48	7.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2009	49	8.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2010	50	9.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2011	51	10.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2012	52	11.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2013	53	12.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2014	54	13.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2015	55	14.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2016	56	15.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2017	57	16.31	16,944	5,136	44,196	66,276	66,276
2018	58	17.31	10,491	3,180	44,196	57,867	57,867
2019	59	18.31			44,196	44,196	44,196
2020	60	19.31			44,196	44,196	43,292
2021	61	20.31			38,590	38,590	36,382
2022	62	21.31			36,504	36,504	33,123
2023	63	22.31			36,504	36,504	31,880
2024	64	23.31			36,504	36,504	30,683
2025	65	24.31			36,504	36,504	29,532
2026	66	25.31			36,504	36,504	28,423
2027	67	26.31			36,504	36,504	27,356
2028	68	27.31			36,504	36,504	26,329
2029	69	28.31			36,504	36,504	25,341
2030	70	29.31			36,504	36,504	24,390
2031	71	30.31			36,504	36,504	23,474
2032	72	31.31			36,504	36,504	22,593
2033	73	32.31			36,504	36,504	21,745
2034	74	33.31			36,504	36,504	20,929
2035	75	34.31			36,504	36,504	20,143
2036	76	35.31			36,504	36,504	19,387
2037	77	36.31			36,504	36,504	18,660
2038	78	37.31			36,504	36,504	17,959
2039	79	38.31			36,504	36,504	17,285
2040	80	39.31			36,504	36,504	16,636
2041	81	40.31			36,504	36,504	16,012
2042	82	41.31			36,504	36,504	15,411
2043	83	42.31			36,504	36,504	14,832
2044	84	43.31			36,504	36,504	14,276
2045	85	44.31			36,504	36,504	13,740
2046	86	45.31			36,504	36,504	13,224
2047	87	46.31			36,504	36,504	12,728
2048	88	47.31			36,504	36,504	12,250
2049	89	48.31			36,504	36,504	11,790
2050	90	48.60			10,709	10,709	3,374
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$286,791</b>	<b>\$86,931</b>	<b>\$1,924,687</b>	<b>\$2,298,409</b>	<b>\$1,845,984</b>



# **Exhibit B-17**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. James Raymond Coyle**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **December 8, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. JAMES RAYMOND COYLE**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,930,272
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	596,410
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,526,682</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
66,498	3.0%	17.270%	4,096	61.729%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. JAMES RAYMOND COYLE**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	26	0.31	1.00000	\$20,391	\$1,256	\$0	(\$3,522)	(\$10,413)	\$7,712	\$7,712
2002	27	1.31	1.08021	71,832	4,425	(1,893)	(12,033)	(35,583)	26,748	26,748
2003	28	2.31	1.07816	77,446	4,770	(2,041)	(12,974)	(38,364)	28,838	28,838
2004	29	3.31	1.07611	83,340	5,133	(2,196)	(13,961)	(41,284)	31,033	31,033
2005	30	4.31	1.07406	89,512	5,514	(2,358)	(14,995)	(44,341)	33,331	33,331
2006	31	5.31	1.07201	95,958	5,911	(2,528)	(16,075)	(47,535)	35,731	35,731
2007	32	6.31	1.06997	102,673	6,324	(2,705)	(17,200)	(50,861)	38,231	38,231
2008	33	7.31	1.06794	109,648	6,754	(2,889)	(18,368)	(54,316)	40,829	40,829
2009	34	8.31	1.06591	116,875	7,199	(3,079)	(19,579)	(57,896)	43,520	43,520
2010	35	9.31	1.06388	124,340	7,659	(3,276)	(20,829)	(61,594)	46,300	46,300
2011	36	10.31	1.06185	132,031	8,133	(3,479)	(22,118)	(65,404)	49,163	49,163
2012	37	11.31	1.05983	139,931	8,619	(3,687)	(23,441)	(69,317)	52,105	52,105
2013	38	12.31	1.05781	148,021	9,117	(3,900)	(24,796)	(73,325)	55,117	55,117
2014	39	13.31	1.05580	156,280	9,626	(4,118)	(26,180)	(77,416)	58,193	58,193
2015	40	14.31	1.05379	164,687	10,144	(4,339)	(27,588)	(81,581)	61,323	61,323
2016	41	15.31	1.05179	173,216	10,669	(4,564)	(29,017)	(85,806)	64,499	64,499
2017	42	16.31	1.04979	181,840	11,201	(4,791)	(30,462)	(90,077)	67,710	67,710
2018	43	17.31	1.04779	190,529	11,736	(5,020)	(31,917)	(94,382)	70,946	70,946
2019	44	18.31	1.04579	199,255	12,273	(5,250)	(33,379)	(98,704)	74,195	74,195
2020	45	19.31	1.04380	207,983	12,811	(5,480)	(34,841)	(103,028)	77,445	75,743
2021	46	20.31	1.04182	216,680	13,347	(5,709)	(36,298)	(107,336)	80,683	75,730
2022	47	21.31	1.03984	225,312	13,878	(5,936)	(37,744)	(111,612)	83,897	75,573
2023	48	22.31	1.03786	233,841	14,404	(6,161)	(39,173)	(115,837)	87,073	75,272
2024	49	23.31	1.03588	242,232	14,920	(6,382)	(40,578)	(119,994)	90,198	74,830
2025	50	24.31	1.03391	250,446	15,426	(6,599)	(41,954)	(124,063)	93,256	74,249
2026	51	25.31	1.03194	258,446	15,919	(6,809)	(43,295)	(128,026)	96,235	73,533
2027	52	26.31	1.03000	266,199	16,397	(7,014)	(44,593)	(131,866)	99,122	72,686
2028	53	27.31	1.03000	274,185	16,889	(7,224)	(45,931)	(135,822)	102,096	71,849
2029	54	28.31	1.03000	282,411	17,395	(7,441)	(47,309)	(139,897)	105,159	71,021
2030	55	29.31	1.03000	290,883	17,917	(7,664)	(48,728)	(144,094)	108,314	70,203
2031	56	30.31	1.03000	299,609	18,455	(7,894)	(50,190)	(148,417)	111,563	69,395
2032	57	31.31	1.03000	308,598	19,008	(8,131)	(51,696)	(152,869)	114,910	68,596
2033	58	32.31	1.03000	317,856	19,579	(8,375)	(53,247)	(157,455)	118,357	67,806
2034	59	32.72	1.03000	136,412	8,402	(3,594)	(22,852)	(67,574)	50,795	28,262
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$6,188,897</b>	<b>\$381,210</b>	<b>(\$162,526)</b>	<b>(\$1,036,863)</b>	<b>(\$3,066,089)</b>	<b>\$2,304,628</b>	<b>\$1,930,272</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	17.270%	61.729%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. JAMES RAYMOND COYLE**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIB.	PROJECTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	26	0.31	(\$438)	\$0	\$0	\$271	(\$168)	(\$168)
2002	27	1.31	(1,544)	0	0	953	(591)	(591)
2003	28	2.31	(1,665)	0	0	1,028	(637)	(637)
2004	29	3.31	(1,792)	0	0	1,106	(686)	(686)
2005	30	4.31	(1,924)	0	0	1,188	(736)	(736)
2006	31	5.31	(2,063)	0	0	1,274	(790)	(790)
2007	32	6.31	(2,207)	0	0	1,363	(845)	(845)
2008	33	7.31	(2,358)	0	0	1,455	(902)	(902)
2009	34	8.31	(2,513)	0	0	1,551	(962)	(962)
2010	35	9.31	(2,674)	0	0	1,651	(1,023)	(1,023)
2011	36	10.31	(2,838)	0	0	1,752	(1,086)	(1,086)
2012	37	11.31	(3,009)	0	0	1,857	(1,152)	(1,152)
2013	38	12.31	(3,182)	0	0	1,964	(1,218)	(1,218)
2014	39	13.31	(3,360)	0	0	2,074	(1,286)	(1,286)
2015	40	14.31	(3,541)	0	0	2,186	(1,355)	(1,355)
2016	41	15.31	(3,725)	0	0	2,299	(1,426)	(1,426)
2017	42	16.31	(3,909)	0	0	2,413	(1,496)	(1,496)
2018	43	17.31	(4,097)	0	0	2,529	(1,568)	(1,568)
2019	44	18.31	(4,285)	0	0	2,645	(1,640)	(1,640)
2020	45	19.31	(3,727)	0	0	2,300	(1,426)	(1,395)
2021	46	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	47	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	48	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	49	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	50	24.31	10,018	24,029	(5,880)	(17,387)	10,780	8,583
2026	51	25.31	10,338	144,173	(26,684)	(78,907)	48,920	37,379
2027	52	26.31	10,648	144,173	(26,738)	(79,065)	49,018	35,945
2028	53	27.31	10,968	144,173	(26,793)	(79,228)	49,119	34,567
2029	54	28.31	11,296	144,173	(26,850)	(79,396)	49,224	33,244
2030	55	29.31	11,635	144,173	(26,908)	(79,569)	49,331	31,974
2031	56	30.31	11,985	144,173	(26,968)	(79,748)	49,441	30,754
2032	57	31.31	12,344	144,173	(27,030)	(79,931)	49,555	29,582
2033	58	32.31	12,714	144,173	(27,094)	(80,120)	49,672	28,457
2034	59	33.31	5,457	144,173	(25,841)	(76,414)	47,375	26,046
2035	60	34.31	0	144,353	(24,930)	(73,719)	45,704	24,115
2036	61	35.31	0	144,533	(24,961)	(73,811)	45,761	23,172
2037	62	36.31	0	144,713	(24,992)	(73,903)	45,818	22,266
2038	63	37.31	0	144,893	(25,023)	(73,995)	45,875	21,395
2039	64	38.31	0	145,073	(25,054)	(74,087)	45,932	20,558
2040	65	39.31	0	145,253	(25,085)	(74,179)	45,989	19,754
2041	66	40.31	0	145,433	(25,116)	(74,271)	46,046	18,981
2042	67	41.31	0	145,613	(25,147)	(74,363)	46,103	18,239
2043	68	42.31	0	145,793	(25,178)	(74,455)	46,160	17,525
2044	69	43.31	0	145,973	(25,210)	(74,547)	46,217	16,839
2045	70	44.31	0	146,153	(25,241)	(74,639)	46,274	16,181
2046	71	45.31	0	146,333	(25,272)	(74,730)	46,331	15,548
2047	72	46.31	0	146,513	(25,303)	(74,822)	46,388	14,939
2048	73	47.31	0	146,693	(25,334)	(74,914)	46,445	14,355
2049	74	48.31	0	146,873	(25,365)	(75,006)	46,502	13,793
2050	75	49.31	0	147,053	(25,396)	(75,098)	46,559	13,253
2051	76	50.31	0	147,233	(25,427)	(75,190)	46,616	12,735
2052	77	51.31	0	147,413	(25,458)	(75,282)	46,673	12,236
2053	78	51.72	0	61,497	(10,621)	(31,406)	19,471	4,958
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$52,551</b>	<b>\$4,008,977</b>	<b>(\$710,899)</b>	<b>(\$2,068,326)</b>	<b>\$1,282,304</b>	<b>\$596,410</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. JAMES RAYMOND COYLE**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	26	0.31				\$0
2002	27	1.31				0
2003	28	2.31				0
2004	29	3.31				0
2005	30	4.31				0
2006	31	5.31				0
2007	32	6.31				0
2008	33	7.31				0
2009	34	8.31				0
2010	35	9.31				0
2011	36	10.31				0
2012	37	11.31				0
2013	38	12.31				0
2014	39	13.31				0
2015	40	14.31				0
2016	41	15.31				0
2017	42	16.31				0
2018	43	17.31				0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-18**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Gerald F. DeConto**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **December 1, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. GERALD F. DeCONTO**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,249,441
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	859,236
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,108,676</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
114,333	3.0%	19.870%	2,436	48.040%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. GERALD F. DECONTO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	44	0.31	1.00000	\$35,059	\$747	\$0	(\$6,966)	(\$13,496)	\$15,344	\$15,344
2002	45	1.31	1.04380	121,108	2,543	(2,972)	(23,342)	(45,221)	52,115	52,115
2003	46	2.31	1.04182	126,172	2,649	(3,097)	(24,318)	(47,112)	54,294	54,294
2004	47	3.31	1.03984	131,199	2,755	(3,220)	(25,287)	(48,989)	56,457	56,457
2005	48	4.31	1.03786	136,165	2,859	(3,342)	(26,244)	(50,843)	58,594	58,594
2006	49	5.31	1.03588	141,051	2,962	(3,462)	(27,186)	(52,668)	60,697	60,697
2007	50	6.31	1.03391	145,834	3,062	(3,579)	(28,108)	(54,454)	62,755	62,755
2008	51	7.31	1.03194	150,493	3,160	(3,694)	(29,006)	(56,193)	64,760	64,760
2009	52	8.31	1.03000	155,006	3,255	(3,804)	(29,876)	(57,879)	66,702	66,702
2010	53	9.31	1.03000	159,657	3,352	(3,919)	(30,772)	(59,615)	68,703	68,703
2011	54	10.31	1.03000	164,447	3,453	(4,036)	(31,695)	(61,404)	70,764	70,764
2012	55	11.31	1.03000	169,380	3,556	(4,157)	(32,646)	(63,246)	72,887	72,887
2013	56	12.31	1.03000	174,462	3,663	(4,282)	(33,626)	(65,144)	75,074	75,074
2014	57	13.31	1.03000	179,695	3,773	(4,410)	(34,634)	(67,097)	77,326	77,326
2015	58	14.31	1.03000	185,086	3,886	(4,543)	(35,673)	(69,111)	79,646	79,646
2016	59	15.31	1.03000	190,639	4,003	(4,679)	(36,744)	(71,184)	82,035	82,035
2017	60	16.31	1.03000	196,357	4,123	(4,819)	(37,846)	(73,319)	84,496	84,496
2018	61	17.31	1.03000	202,248	4,246	(4,964)	(38,981)	(75,519)	87,031	87,031
2019	62	17.97	1.03000	138,876	2,916	(3,409)	(26,767)	(51,856)	59,761	59,761
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,902,935</b>	<b>\$60,961</b>	<b>(\$70,388)</b>	<b>(\$559,718)</b>	<b>(\$1,084,350)</b>	<b>\$1,249,441</b>	<b>\$1,249,441</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	19.870%	48.040%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. GERALD F. DeCONTO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIB.	PROJECTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	44	0.31	\$0	\$11,207	(\$2,227)	(\$4,314)	\$4,666	\$4,666
2002	45	1.31	4,844	45,726	(9,086)	(19,929)	21,555	21,555
2003	46	2.31	4,895	46,641	(9,268)	(20,306)	21,963	21,963
2004	47	3.31	5,091	47,574	(9,453)	(20,759)	22,453	22,453
2005	48	4.31	5,283	48,525	(9,642)	(21,217)	22,949	22,949
2006	49	5.31	5,473	49,496	(9,835)	(21,682)	23,452	23,452
2007	50	6.31	5,658	50,486	(10,032)	(22,153)	23,960	23,960
2008	51	7.31	5,839	51,496	(10,232)	(22,628)	24,475	24,475
2009	52	8.31	6,014	52,526	(10,437)	(23,109)	24,994	24,994
2010	53	9.31	6,195	53,577	(10,646)	(23,600)	25,526	25,526
2011	54	10.31	6,381	54,649	(10,859)	(24,102)	26,069	26,069
2012	55	11.31	6,572	55,742	(11,076)	(24,615)	26,623	26,623
2013	56	12.31	6,769	56,857	(11,297)	(25,139)	27,190	27,190
2014	57	13.31	6,972	57,994	(11,523)	(25,674)	27,769	27,769
2015	58	14.31	7,181	59,154	(11,754)	(26,221)	28,361	28,361
2016	59	15.31	7,397	60,337	(11,989)	(26,780)	28,965	28,965
2017	60	16.31	7,619	61,544	(12,229)	(27,351)	29,583	29,583
2018	61	17.31	7,847	62,775	(12,473)	(27,935)	30,214	30,214
2019	62	18.31	5,388	64,031	(12,723)	(27,237)	29,459	29,459
2020	63	19.31	0	65,312	(12,977)	(25,141)	27,193	26,637
2021	64	20.31	0	66,618	(13,237)	(25,644)	27,737	26,150
2022	65	21.31	0	67,950	(13,502)	(26,157)	28,291	25,671
2023	66	22.31	0	69,309	(13,772)	(26,680)	28,857	25,202
2024	67	23.31	0	70,695	(14,047)	(27,214)	29,434	24,741
2025	68	24.31	0	72,109	(14,328)	(27,758)	30,023	24,289
2026	69	25.31	0	73,551	(14,615)	(28,313)	30,623	23,844
2027	70	26.31	0	75,022	(14,907)	(28,879)	31,236	23,408
2028	71	27.31	0	76,522	(15,205)	(29,457)	31,860	22,980
2029	72	28.31	0	78,052	(15,509)	(30,046)	32,497	22,560
2030	73	29.31	0	79,613	(15,819)	(30,647)	33,147	22,147
2031	74	30.31	0	81,205	(16,135)	(31,259)	33,810	21,742
2032	75	31.31	0	82,829	(16,458)	(31,885)	34,486	21,345
2033	76	32.31	0	84,486	(16,787)	(32,522)	35,176	20,954
2034	77	33.31	0	86,176	(17,123)	(33,173)	35,880	20,571
2035	78	34.31	0	87,900	(17,466)	(33,837)	36,598	20,195
2036	79	35.14	0	74,715	(14,846)	(28,761)	31,108	16,574
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$111,419</b>	<b>\$2,282,401</b>	<b>(\$453,513)</b>	<b>(\$932,123)</b>	<b>\$1,008,183</b>	<b>\$859,236</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. GERALD F. DeCONTO**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	44	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	45	1.31			0	0
2003	46	2.31			0	0
2004	47	3.31			0	0
2005	48	4.31			0	0
2006	49	5.31			0	0
2007	50	6.31			0	0
2008	51	7.31			0	0
2009	52	8.31			0	0
2010	53	9.31			0	0
2011	54	10.31			0	0
2012	55	11.31			0	0
2013	56	12.31			0	0
2014	57	13.31			0	0
2015	58	14.31			0	0
2016	59	15.31			0	0
2017	60	16.31			0	0
2018	61	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-19**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. James J. Carson, Jr.**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **February 6, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. JAMES J. CARSON, JR.**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$3,019,425
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	140,333
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	676,263
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$3,836,021</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
79,455	3.0%	18.440%	2,456	11.760%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. JAMES J. CARSON, JR.**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	32	0.31	1.00000	\$24,364	\$753	\$0	(\$4,493)	(\$2,337)	\$18,287	\$18,287
2002	33	1.31	1.06794	84,853	2,622	(2,140)	(15,177)	(7,895)	62,263	62,263
2003	34	2.31	1.06591	90,445	2,795	(2,281)	(16,178)	(8,415)	66,366	66,366
2004	35	3.31	1.06388	96,222	2,974	(2,427)	(17,211)	(8,953)	70,605	70,605
2005	36	4.31	1.06185	102,174	3,158	(2,577)	(18,276)	(9,506)	74,972	74,972
2006	37	5.31	1.05983	108,287	3,347	(2,731)	(19,369)	(10,075)	79,458	79,458
2007	38	6.31	1.05781	114,548	3,540	(2,889)	(20,489)	(10,658)	84,052	84,052
2008	39	7.31	1.05580	120,940	3,738	(3,051)	(21,632)	(11,252)	88,742	88,742
2009	40	8.31	1.05379	127,445	3,939	(3,215)	(22,796)	(11,858)	93,516	93,516
2010	41	9.31	1.05179	134,045	4,143	(3,381)	(23,976)	(12,472)	98,359	98,359
2011	42	10.31	1.04979	140,719	4,349	(3,550)	(25,170)	(13,093)	103,256	103,256
2012	43	11.31	1.04779	147,443	4,557	(3,719)	(26,373)	(13,718)	108,190	108,190
2013	44	12.31	1.04579	154,196	4,766	(3,889)	(27,581)	(14,346)	113,145	113,145
2014	45	13.31	1.04380	160,950	4,974	(4,060)	(28,789)	(14,975)	118,101	118,101
2015	46	14.31	1.04182	167,680	5,182	(4,230)	(29,993)	(15,601)	123,039	123,039
2016	47	15.31	1.03984	174,360	5,389	(4,398)	(31,187)	(16,223)	127,941	127,941
2017	48	16.31	1.03786	180,961	5,593	(4,565)	(32,368)	(16,837)	132,784	132,784
2018	49	17.31	1.03588	187,454	5,793	(4,728)	(33,529)	(17,441)	137,549	137,549
2019	50	18.31	1.03391	193,810	5,990	(4,889)	(34,666)	(18,032)	142,213	142,213
2020	51	19.31	1.03194	200,001	6,181	(5,045)	(35,774)	(18,608)	146,756	143,531
2021	52	20.31	1.03000	206,001	6,367	(5,196)	(36,847)	(19,167)	151,158	141,878
2022	53	21.31	1.03000	212,181	6,558	(5,352)	(37,952)	(29,141)	146,293	131,778
2023	54	22.31	1.03000	218,547	6,754	(5,513)	(39,091)	(30,015)	150,682	130,260
2024	55	23.31	1.03000	225,103	6,957	(5,678)	(40,264)	(30,916)	155,203	128,760
2025	56	24.31	1.03000	231,856	7,166	(5,848)	(41,472)	(31,843)	159,859	127,277
2026	57	25.31	1.03000	238,812	7,381	(6,024)	(42,716)	(32,799)	164,655	125,811
2027	58	26.31	1.03000	245,976	7,602	(6,205)	(43,997)	(33,783)	169,594	124,362
2028	59	27.31	1.03000	253,355	7,830	(6,391)	(45,317)	(34,796)	174,682	122,930
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$4,542,729</b>	<b>\$140,399</b>	<b>(\$113,972)</b>	<b>(\$812,684)</b>	<b>(\$494,753)</b>	<b>\$3,261,719</b>	<b>\$3,019,425</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	11.760%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. JAMES J. CARSON, JR.**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	32	0.31	\$975	\$0	\$0	(\$115)	\$860	\$860
2002	33	1.31	3,292	0	0	(387)	2,905	2,905
2003	34	2.31	3,509	0	0	(413)	3,097	3,097
2004	35	3.31	3,733	0	0	(439)	3,294	3,294
2005	36	4.31	3,964	0	0	(466)	3,498	3,498
2006	37	5.31	4,202	0	0	(494)	3,707	3,707
2007	38	6.31	4,444	0	0	(523)	3,922	3,922
2008	39	7.31	4,692	0	0	(552)	4,141	4,141
2009	40	8.31	4,945	0	0	(582)	4,363	4,363
2010	41	9.31	5,201	0	0	(612)	4,589	4,589
2011	42	10.31	5,460	0	0	(642)	4,818	4,818
2012	43	11.31	5,721	0	0	(673)	5,048	5,048
2013	44	12.31	5,983	0	0	(704)	5,279	5,279
2014	45	13.31	6,245	0	0	(734)	5,510	5,510
2015	46	14.31	6,506	0	0	(765)	5,741	5,741
2016	47	15.31	6,765	0	0	(796)	5,970	5,970
2017	48	16.31	7,021	0	0	(826)	6,196	6,196
2018	49	17.31	7,273	0	0	(855)	6,418	6,418
2019	50	18.31	7,520	0	0	(884)	6,635	6,635
2020	51	19.31	7,760	0	0	(913)	6,847	6,697
2021	52	20.31	7,993	0	0	(1,388)	6,605	6,200
2022	53	21.31	8,233	0	0	(1,429)	6,803	6,128
2023	54	22.31	8,480	0	0	(1,472)	7,008	6,058
2024	55	23.31	8,734	0	0	(1,516)	7,218	5,988
2025	56	24.31	8,996	0	0	(1,562)	7,434	5,919
2026	57	25.31	9,266	0	0	(1,609)	7,657	5,851
2027	58	26.31	9,544	0	0	(1,657)	7,887	5,784
2028	59	27.31	9,830	0	0	(1,707)	8,124	5,717
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$176,287</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$24,712)</b>	<b>\$151,575</b>	<b>\$140,333</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. JAMES J. CARSON, JR.**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	32	0.31	\$8,449	\$2,208	\$10,656	\$10,656
2002	33	1.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2003	34	2.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2004	35	3.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2005	36	4.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2006	37	5.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2007	38	6.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2008	39	7.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2009	40	8.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2010	41	9.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2011	42	10.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2012	43	11.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2013	44	12.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2014	45	13.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2015	46	14.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2016	47	15.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2017	48	16.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2018	49	17.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2019	50	18.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	34,752
2020	51	19.31	27,552	7,200	34,752	33,988
2021	52	19.49	5,052	1,320	6,372	6,082
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$536,988</b>	<b>\$140,328</b>	<b>\$677,316</b>	<b>\$676,263</b>

# **Exhibit B-20**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Jacquelyn D. Aldridge-Frederick**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **January 6, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. JACQUELYN D. ALDRIDGE-FREDERICK**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$696,642
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	169,581
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$866,223</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
37,855	3.0%	14.030%	12,017	24.730%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. JACQUELYN D. ALDRIDGE-FREDERICK**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	47	0.31	1.00000	\$11,608	\$3,685	\$0	(\$1,629)	(\$2,468)	\$11,196	\$11,196
2002	48	1.31	1.03786	39,289	12,472	(1,335)	(5,347)	(8,102)	36,977	36,977
2003	49	2.31	1.03588	40,698	12,920	(1,383)	(5,539)	(8,393)	38,304	38,304
2004	50	3.31	1.03391	42,078	13,358	(1,430)	(5,726)	(8,678)	39,602	39,602
2005	51	4.31	1.03194	43,422	13,785	(1,475)	(5,909)	(8,955)	40,867	40,867
2006	52	5.31	1.03000	44,725	14,198	(1,520)	(6,087)	(9,223)	42,093	42,093
2007	53	6.31	1.03000	46,067	14,624	(1,565)	(6,269)	(9,500)	43,356	43,356
2008	54	7.31	1.03000	47,449	15,063	(1,612)	(6,457)	(9,785)	44,657	44,657
2009	55	8.31	1.03000	48,872	15,515	(1,661)	(6,651)	(10,079)	45,997	45,997
2010	56	9.31	1.03000	50,339	15,980	(1,710)	(6,851)	(10,381)	47,377	47,377
2011	57	10.31	1.03000	51,849	16,460	(1,762)	(7,056)	(10,693)	48,798	48,798
2012	58	11.31	1.03000	53,404	16,953	(1,815)	(7,268)	(11,013)	50,262	50,262
2013	59	12.31	1.03000	55,006	17,462	(1,869)	(7,486)	(11,344)	51,770	51,770
2014	60	13.31	1.03000	56,656	17,986	(1,925)	(7,710)	(11,684)	53,323	53,323
2015	61	14.31	1.03000	58,356	18,525	(1,983)	(7,942)	(12,035)	54,922	54,922
2016	62	15.14	1.03000	50,089	15,901	(1,702)	(6,817)	(10,330)	47,142	47,142
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$739,908</b>	<b>\$234,886</b>	<b>(\$24,747)</b>	<b>(\$100,744)</b>	<b>(\$152,662)</b>	<b>\$696,642</b>	<b>\$696,642</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	14.030%	24.730%	0.000%	4.720%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. JACQUELYN D. ALDRIDGE-FREDERICK**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	47	0.31	\$0	\$471	\$0	(\$116)	\$355	\$355
2002	48	1.31	0	1,594	0	(394)	1,200	1,200
2003	49	2.31	0	1,602	0	(396)	1,206	1,206
2004	50	3.31	0	1,656	0	(410)	1,247	1,247
2005	51	4.31	0	1,709	0	(423)	1,286	1,286
2006	52	5.31	0	1,760	0	(435)	1,325	1,325
2007	53	6.31	0	1,813	0	(448)	1,365	1,365
2008	54	7.31	0	1,868	0	(462)	1,406	1,406
2009	55	8.31	0	1,924	0	(476)	1,448	1,448
2010	56	9.31	0	1,981	0	(490)	1,491	1,491
2011	57	10.31	0	2,041	0	(505)	1,536	1,536
2012	58	11.31	0	2,102	0	(520)	1,582	1,582
2013	59	12.31	0	2,165	0	(535)	1,630	1,630
2014	60	13.31	0	2,230	0	(551)	1,679	1,679
2015	61	14.31	0	2,297	0	(568)	1,729	1,729
2016	62	15.31	0	1,972	0	(488)	1,484	1,484
2017	63	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	64	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	65	18.31	3,400	0	(477)	(723)	2,200	2,200
2020	66	19.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	12,931
2021	67	20.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	12,445
2022	68	21.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	11,978
2023	69	22.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	11,529
2024	70	23.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	11,096
2025	71	24.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	10,679
2026	72	25.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	10,279
2027	73	26.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	9,893
2028	74	27.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	9,521
2029	75	28.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	9,164
2030	76	29.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	8,820
2031	77	30.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	8,489
2032	78	31.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	8,170
2033	79	32.31	20,400	0	(2,862)	(4,337)	13,201	7,864
2034	80	32.64	6,800	0	(954)	(1,446)	4,400	2,555
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$295,800</b>	<b>\$29,185</b>	<b>(\$41,501)</b>	<b>(\$70,106)</b>	<b>\$213,379</b>	<b>\$169,581</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. JACQUELYN D. ALDRIDGE-FREDERICK**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	47	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	48	1.31			0	0
2003	49	2.31			0	0
2004	50	3.31			0	0
2005	51	4.31			0	0
2006	52	5.31			0	0
2007	53	6.31			0	0
2008	54	7.31			0	0
2009	55	8.31			0	0
2010	56	9.31			0	0
2011	57	10.31			0	0
2012	58	11.31			0	0
2013	59	12.31			0	0
2014	60	13.31			0	0
2015	61	14.31			0	0
2016	62	15.31			0	0
2017	63	16.31			0	0
2018	64	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-21**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Joseph Amatuccio**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 31, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. JOSEPH AMATUCCIO**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$3,468,556
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	1,131,075
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	416,494
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$5,016,125</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
122,603	3.0%	21.600%	9,852	6.680%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. JOSEPH AMATUCCIO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	41	0.31	1.00000	\$37,595	\$3,021	\$0	(\$8,121)	(\$1,969)	\$30,527	\$30,527
2002	42	1.31	1.04979	128,707	10,342	(3,270)	(26,967)	(6,538)	102,274	102,274
2003	43	2.31	1.04779	134,858	10,837	(3,427)	(28,255)	(6,851)	107,161	107,161
2004	44	3.31	1.04579	141,033	11,333	(3,584)	(29,549)	(7,165)	112,069	112,069
2005	45	4.31	1.04380	147,211	11,829	(3,741)	(30,844)	(7,478)	116,978	116,978
2006	46	5.31	1.04182	153,367	12,324	(3,897)	(32,133)	(7,791)	121,870	121,870
2007	47	6.31	1.03984	159,477	12,815	(4,052)	(33,414)	(8,101)	126,724	126,724
2008	48	7.31	1.03786	165,514	13,300	(4,206)	(34,678)	(8,408)	131,522	131,522
2009	49	8.31	1.03588	171,453	13,777	(4,357)	(35,923)	(8,710)	136,241	136,241
2010	50	9.31	1.03391	177,267	14,245	(4,504)	(37,141)	(9,005)	140,861	140,861
2011	51	10.31	1.03194	182,929	14,700	(4,648)	(38,327)	(9,293)	145,360	145,360
2012	52	11.31	1.03000	188,417	15,141	(4,788)	(39,477)	(9,572)	149,721	149,721
2013	53	12.31	1.03000	194,069	15,595	(4,931)	(40,661)	(9,859)	154,213	154,213
2014	54	13.31	1.03000	199,892	16,063	(5,079)	(41,881)	(10,155)	158,839	158,839
2015	55	14.31	1.03000	205,888	16,544	(5,232)	(43,138)	(10,459)	163,604	163,604
2016	56	15.31	1.03000	212,065	17,041	(5,389)	(44,432)	(10,143)	159,143	159,143
2017	57	16.31	1.03000	218,427	17,552	(5,550)	(45,765)	(10,747)	163,917	163,917
2018	58	17.31	1.03000	224,980	18,079	(5,717)	(47,138)	(11,369)	168,834	168,834
2019	59	18.31	1.03000	231,729	18,621	(5,888)	(48,552)	(12,011)	173,899	173,899
2020	60	19.31	1.03000	238,681	19,180	(6,065)	(50,008)	(12,671)	179,116	175,453
2021	61	20.31	1.03000	245,841	19,755	(6,247)	(51,509)	(13,351)	184,490	173,933
2022	62	21.31	1.03000	253,217	20,348	(6,434)	(53,054)	(14,052)	190,025	172,427
2023	63	22.31	1.03000	260,813	20,958	(6,627)	(54,646)	(14,773)	195,725	170,933
2024	64	23.31	1.03000	268,637	21,587	(6,826)	(56,285)	(15,516)	201,597	169,453
2025	65	23.56	1.03000	69,175	5,559	(1,758)	(14,493)	(6,570)	51,912	42,601
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$4,611,241</b>	<b>\$370,543</b>	<b>(\$116,216)</b>	<b>(\$966,391)</b>	<b>(\$332,556)</b>	<b>\$3,566,621</b>	<b>\$3,468,556</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	6.680%	0.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. JOSEPH AMATUCCIO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	VESTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	41	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	42	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	43	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	44	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	45	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	46	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	47	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	48	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	49	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	50	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	51	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	52	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	53	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	54	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	55	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	56	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	57	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	58	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	59	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	60	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	61	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	62	21.31	0	(21,667)	4,680	1,135	(15,852)	(14,384)
2023	63	22.31	0	(28,889)	6,240	1,513	(21,136)	(18,459)
2024	64	23.31	0	(28,889)	6,240	1,513	(21,136)	(17,766)
2025	65	24.31	159,260	(28,889)	(28,160)	(6,828)	95,383	77,165
2026	66	25.31	212,346	(28,889)	(39,627)	(9,608)	134,222	104,510
2027	67	26.31	212,346	(29,069)	(39,588)	(9,598)	134,091	100,488
2028	68	27.31	212,346	(29,249)	(39,549)	(9,589)	133,959	96,622
2029	69	28.31	212,346	(29,429)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	92,903
2030	70	29.31	212,526	(29,609)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	89,416
2031	71	30.31	212,706	(29,789)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	86,060
2032	72	31.31	212,886	(29,969)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	82,829
2033	73	32.31	213,066	(30,149)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	79,720
2034	74	33.31	213,246	(30,329)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	76,728
2035	75	34.31	213,426	(30,509)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	73,848
2036	76	35.31	213,606	(30,689)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	71,076
2037	77	36.31	213,786	(30,869)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	68,408
2038	78	37.31	213,966	(31,049)	(39,510)	(9,580)	133,827	65,840
2039	79	37.56	53,537	(7,807)	(9,878)	(2,395)	33,457	16,070
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$2,981,395</b>	<b>(\$505,738)</b>	<b>(\$534,742)</b>	<b>(\$129,653)</b>	<b>\$1,811,262</b>	<b>\$1,131,075</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. JOSEPH AMATUCCIO**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	41	0.31	\$11,587	\$1,527	\$13,114	\$13,114
2002	42	1.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2003	43	2.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2004	44	3.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2005	45	4.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2006	46	5.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2007	47	6.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2008	48	7.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2009	49	8.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2010	50	9.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2011	51	10.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2012	52	11.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2013	53	12.31	16,188	4,980	21,168	21,168
2014	54	13.31	14,148	3,691	17,838	17,838
2015	55	14.31	11,380	1,943	13,323	13,323
2016	56	15.31	8,304	0	8,304	8,304
2017	57	16.31	8,304	0	8,304	8,304
2018	58	17.31	8,304	0	8,304	8,304
2019	59	18.31	8,304	0	8,304	8,304
2020	60	19.31	8,304	0	8,304	8,134
2021	61	20.31	8,304	0	8,304	7,829
2022	62	21.31	8,304	0	8,304	7,535
2023	63	22.31	8,304	0	8,304	7,252
2024	64	23.31	8,304	0	8,304	6,980
2025	65	24.31	8,304	0	8,304	6,718
2026	66	25.31	8,304	0	8,304	6,466
2027	67	26.31	8,304	0	8,304	6,223
2028	68	27.31	8,304	0	8,304	5,989
2029	69	28.31	8,304	0	8,304	5,765
2030	70	29.31	8,304	0	8,304	5,548
2031	71	30.31	8,304	0	8,304	5,340
2032	72	31.31	8,304	0	8,304	5,140
2033	73	31.32	111	0	111	67
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$372,650</b>	<b>\$66,921</b>	<b>\$439,571</b>	<b>\$416,494</b>

# **Exhibit B-22**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Veronique N. Bowers**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 7, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. VERONIQUE N. BOWERS**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,055,319
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	87,998
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	1,060,356
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$3,203,673</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
33,697	3.0%	12.250%	3,033	14.826%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. VERONIQUE N. BOWERS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	28	0.31	1.00000	\$10,333	\$930	\$0	(\$1,266)	(\$1,344)	\$8,653	\$8,653
2002	29	1.31	1.07611	36,262	3,235	(1,040)	(4,309)	(4,576)	29,572	29,572
2003	30	2.31	1.07406	38,948	3,449	(1,116)	(4,628)	(4,915)	31,737	31,737
2004	31	3.31	1.07201	41,752	3,524	(1,192)	(4,961)	(5,269)	33,854	33,854
2005	32	4.31	1.06997	44,674	3,596	(1,271)	(5,308)	(5,638)	36,053	36,053
2006	33	5.31	1.06794	47,709	3,664	(1,352)	(5,669)	(6,021)	38,331	38,331
2007	34	6.31	1.06591	50,853	3,728	(1,437)	(6,043)	(6,418)	40,684	40,684
2008	35	7.31	1.06388	54,101	3,787	(1,524)	(6,429)	(6,827)	43,108	43,108
2009	36	8.31	1.06185	57,448	3,842	(1,613)	(6,826)	(7,250)	45,600	45,600
2010	37	9.31	1.05983	60,885	3,892	(1,705)	(7,235)	(7,683)	48,153	48,153
2011	38	10.31	1.05781	64,405	3,936	(1,799)	(7,653)	(8,128)	50,761	50,761
2012	39	11.31	1.05580	67,999	3,974	(1,895)	(8,080)	(8,581)	53,417	53,417
2013	40	12.31	1.05379	71,657	4,007	(1,992)	(8,515)	(9,043)	56,114	56,114
2014	41	13.31	1.05179	75,368	4,034	(2,090)	(8,956)	(9,511)	58,845	58,845
2015	42	14.31	1.04979	79,120	4,054	(2,190)	(9,401)	(9,985)	61,598	61,598
2016	43	15.31	1.04779	82,901	4,067	(2,289)	(9,851)	(10,462)	64,366	64,366
2017	44	16.31	1.04579	86,697	4,074	(2,390)	(10,302)	(10,941)	67,139	67,139
2018	45	17.31	1.04380	90,495	4,074	(2,490)	(10,753)	(11,420)	69,906	69,906
2019	46	18.31	1.04182	94,279	4,068	(2,589)	(11,203)	(11,898)	72,658	72,658
2020	47	19.31	1.03984	98,035	4,054	(2,687)	(11,649)	(12,372)	75,381	73,724
2021	48	20.31	1.03786	101,746	4,034	(2,785)	(12,090)	(12,848)	72,225	67,791
2022	49	21.31	1.03588	105,397	4,008	(2,880)	(12,524)	(13,351)	74,650	67,243
2023	50	22.31	1.03391	108,971	3,975	(2,973)	(12,948)	(13,854)	77,017	66,579
2024	51	23.31	1.03194	112,452	3,935	(3,064)	(13,362)	(14,357)	79,315	65,801
2025	52	24.31	1.03000	115,825	3,891	(3,152)	(13,763)	(14,860)	81,536	64,918
2026	53	25.31	1.03000	119,300	3,846	(3,242)	(14,176)	(15,363)	83,825	64,050
2027	54	26.31	1.03000	122,879	3,801	(3,335)	(14,601)	(15,866)	86,184	63,198
2028	55	27.31	1.03000	126,565	3,758	(3,431)	(15,039)	(16,369)	88,616	62,363
2029	56	28.31	1.03000	130,362	3,715	(3,530)	(15,490)	(16,872)	91,123	61,542
2030	57	29.31	1.03000	134,273	3,672	(3,631)	(15,955)	(17,375)	93,706	60,736
2031	58	30.31	1.03000	138,301	3,630	(3,736)	(16,434)	(17,878)	96,369	59,944
2032	59	31.31	1.03000	142,450	3,587	(3,844)	(16,927)	(18,381)	99,113	59,166
2033	60	32.31	1.03000	146,724	3,546	(3,956)	(17,434)	(18,884)	101,941	58,401
2034	61	33.31	1.03000	151,126	3,506	(4,071)	(17,958)	(19,387)	104,857	57,650
2035	62	34.31	1.03000	155,659	3,465	(4,189)	(18,496)	(19,890)	107,860	56,911
2036	63	35.31	1.03000	160,329	3,425	(4,311)	(19,051)	(20,393)	110,956	56,185
2037	64	36.31	1.03000	165,139	3,386	(4,436)	(19,623)	(20,896)	114,147	55,471
2038	65	36.72	1.03000	70,874	1,394	(1,902)	(8,422)	(9,012)	48,931	23,094
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$3,562,293</b>	<b>\$138,563</b>	<b>(\$97,129)</b>	<b>(\$423,327)</b>	<b>(\$582,095)</b>	<b>\$2,598,305</b>	<b>\$2,055,319</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	14.826%	4.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. VERONIQUE N. BOWERS**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	28	0.31	\$413	\$0	\$0	(\$61)	\$352	\$352
2002	29	1.31	1,450	0	0	(215)	1,235	1,235
2003	30	2.31	1,511	0	0	(224)	1,287	1,287
2004	31	3.31	1,620	0	0	(240)	1,380	1,380
2005	32	4.31	1,733	0	0	(257)	1,476	1,476
2006	33	5.31	1,851	0	0	(274)	1,577	1,577
2007	34	6.31	1,973	0	0	(293)	1,681	1,681
2008	35	7.31	2,099	0	0	(311)	1,788	1,788
2009	36	8.31	2,229	0	0	(330)	1,898	1,898
2010	37	9.31	2,362	0	0	(350)	2,012	2,012
2011	38	10.31	2,499	0	0	(370)	2,128	2,128
2012	39	11.31	2,638	0	0	(391)	2,247	2,247
2013	40	12.31	2,780	0	0	(412)	2,368	2,368
2014	41	13.31	2,924	0	0	(434)	2,491	2,491
2015	42	14.31	3,070	0	0	(455)	2,615	2,615
2016	43	15.31	3,217	0	0	(477)	2,740	2,740
2017	44	16.31	3,364	0	0	(499)	2,865	2,865
2018	45	17.31	3,511	0	0	(521)	2,991	2,991
2019	46	18.31	3,658	0	0	(542)	3,116	3,116
2020	47	19.31	3,804	0	0	(564)	3,240	3,169
2021	48	20.31	3,948	0	0	(852)	3,096	2,906
2022	49	21.31	4,089	0	0	(882)	3,207	2,889
2023	50	22.31	4,228	0	0	(912)	3,316	2,867
2024	51	23.31	4,363	0	0	(941)	3,422	2,839
2025	52	24.31	4,494	0	0	(969)	3,525	2,806
2026	53	25.31	4,629	0	0	(998)	3,630	2,774
2027	54	26.31	4,768	0	0	(1,028)	3,739	2,742
2028	55	27.31	4,911	0	0	(1,059)	3,851	2,710
2029	56	28.31	5,058	0	0	(1,091)	3,967	2,679
2030	57	29.31	5,210	0	0	(1,124)	4,086	2,648
2031	58	30.31	5,366	0	0	(1,157)	4,209	2,618
2032	59	31.31	5,527	0	0	(1,192)	4,335	2,588
2033	60	32.31	5,693	0	0	(1,228)	4,465	2,558
2034	61	33.31	5,864	0	0	(1,265)	4,599	2,528
2035	62	34.31	6,040	0	0	(1,303)	4,737	2,499
2036	63	35.31	6,221	0	0	(1,342)	4,879	2,471
2037	64	36.31	6,407	0	0	(1,382)	5,025	2,442
2038	65	36.72	2,750	0	0	(593)	2,157	1,018
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$138,273</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$26,541)</b>	<b>\$111,732</b>	<b>\$87,998</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MRS. VERONIQUE N. BOWERS**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	ASSISTED LIVING FOR SON W/ CEREBELLAR	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	28	0.31	\$4,224	\$6,502	\$0	\$10,726	\$10,726
2002	29	1.31	13,776	21,204	0	34,980	34,980
2003	30	2.31	13,776	15,636	0	29,412	29,412
2004	31	3.31	13,776	15,636	0	29,412	29,412
2005	32	4.31	13,776	15,636	0	29,412	29,412
2006	33	5.31	13,776	15,636	0	29,412	29,412
2007	34	6.31	13,776	15,636	0	29,412	29,412
2008	35	7.31	13,776	15,636	0	29,412	29,412
2009	36	8.31	13,776	15,636	0	29,412	29,412
2010	37	9.31	12,681	14,394	2,058	29,134	29,134
2011	38	10.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2012	39	11.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2013	40	12.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2014	41	13.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2015	42	14.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2016	43	15.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2017	44	16.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2018	45	17.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2019	46	18.31			25,908	25,908	25,908
2020	47	19.31			25,908	25,908	25,339
2021	48	20.31			25,908	25,908	24,317
2022	49	21.31			25,908	25,908	23,337
2023	50	22.31			25,908	25,908	22,397
2024	51	23.31			25,908	25,908	21,494
2025	52	24.31			25,908	25,908	20,628
2026	53	25.31			25,908	25,908	19,796
2027	54	26.31			25,908	25,908	18,998
2028	55	27.31			25,908	25,908	18,232
2029	56	28.31			25,908	25,908	17,498
2030	57	29.31			25,908	25,908	16,792
2031	58	30.31			25,908	25,908	16,115
2032	59	31.31			25,908	25,908	15,466
2033	60	32.31			25,908	25,908	14,842
2034	61	33.31			25,908	25,908	14,244
2035	62	34.31			25,908	25,908	13,670
2036	63	35.31			25,908	25,908	13,119
2037	64	36.31			25,908	25,908	12,590
2038	65	37.31			25,908	25,908	12,083
2039	66	38.31			25,908	25,908	11,596
2040	67	39.31			25,908	25,908	11,128
2041	68	40.31			25,908	25,908	10,680
2042	69	41.31			25,908	25,908	10,249
2043	70	42.31			25,908	25,908	9,836
2044	71	43.31			25,908	25,908	9,440
2045	72	44.31			25,908	25,908	9,059
2046	73	45.31			25,908	25,908	8,694
2047	74	46.31			25,908	25,908	8,344
2048	75	47.31			25,908	25,908	8,007
2049	76	48.31			25,908	25,908	7,685
2050	77	49.31			25,908	25,908	7,375
2051	78	50.31			25,908	25,908	7,078
2052	79	51.31			25,908	25,908	6,792
2053	80	52.31			25,908	25,908	6,519
2054	81	53.31			25,908	25,908	6,256
2055	82	54.31			25,908	25,908	6,004
2056	83	55.31			25,908	25,908	5,762
2057	84	56.31			25,908	25,908	5,529
2058	85	57.31			25,908	25,908	5,307
2059	86	58.31			25,908	25,908	5,093
2060	87	59.31			25,908	25,908	4,887
2061	88	60.31			25,908	25,908	4,690
2062	89	61.31			25,908	25,908	4,501
2063	90	62.31			25,908	25,908	4,320
2064	91	63.31			25,908	25,908	4,146
2065	92	64.31			25,908	25,908	3,979
2066	93	65.31			25,908	25,908	3,818
2067	94	66.31			25,908	25,908	3,664
2068	95	67.31			25,908	25,908	3,517
2069	96	67.76			11,746	11,746	1,547
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$127,114</b>	<b>\$151,552</b>	<b>\$1,516,468</b>	<b>\$1,795,134</b>	<b>\$1,060,356</b>

# **Exhibit B-23**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Michael Boccardi**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 15, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES  
MR. MICHAEL BOCCARDI**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$3,935,594
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	355,769
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$4,291,363</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
164,675	3.0%	30.390%	6,708	48.039%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. MICHAEL BOCCARDI**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	30	0.31	1.00000	\$50,496	\$2,057	\$0	(\$15,346)	(\$16,886)	\$20,321	\$20,321
2002	31	1.31	1.07201	176,534	7,191	(3,837)	(52,039)	(57,262)	70,587	70,587
2003	32	2.31	1.06997	188,887	7,694	(4,105)	(55,681)	(61,269)	75,526	75,526
2004	33	3.31	1.06794	201,719	8,217	(4,384)	(59,463)	(65,432)	80,657	80,657
2005	34	4.31	1.06591	215,014	8,759	(4,673)	(63,382)	(69,744)	85,973	85,973
2006	35	5.31	1.06388	228,748	9,318	(4,972)	(67,431)	(74,199)	91,465	91,465
2007	36	6.31	1.06185	242,896	9,895	(5,279)	(71,602)	(78,788)	97,122	97,122
2008	37	7.31	1.05983	257,429	10,487	(5,595)	(75,886)	(83,502)	102,933	102,933
2009	38	8.31	1.05781	272,313	11,093	(5,918)	(80,273)	(88,330)	108,884	108,884
2010	39	9.31	1.05580	287,508	11,712	(6,249)	(84,752)	(93,259)	114,960	114,960
2011	40	10.31	1.05379	302,974	12,342	(6,585)	(89,312)	(98,276)	121,144	121,144
2012	41	11.31	1.05179	318,664	12,981	(6,926)	(93,937)	(103,365)	127,418	127,418
2013	42	12.31	1.04979	334,529	13,627	(7,271)	(98,613)	(108,511)	133,761	133,761
2014	43	13.31	1.04779	350,515	14,279	(7,618)	(103,326)	(113,697)	140,153	140,153
2015	44	14.31	1.04579	366,567	14,932	(7,967)	(108,058)	(118,903)	146,571	146,571
2016	45	15.31	1.04380	382,624	15,587	(8,316)	(112,791)	(124,112)	152,992	152,992
2017	46	16.31	1.04182	398,625	16,238	(8,664)	(117,508)	(129,302)	159,390	159,390
2018	47	17.31	1.03984	414,504	16,885	(9,009)	(122,189)	(134,453)	165,739	165,739
2019	48	18.31	1.03786	430,196	17,524	(9,350)	(126,814)	(139,543)	172,013	172,013
2020	49	19.31	1.03588	445,632	18,153	(9,685)	(131,365)	(144,550)	178,185	174,271
2021	50	20.31	1.03391	460,743	18,769	(10,014)	(135,819)	(149,451)	184,228	172,918
2022	51	21.31	1.03194	475,461	19,368	(10,334)	(140,158)	(154,225)	190,112	171,249
2023	52	22.31	1.03000	489,724	19,949	(10,644)	(144,362)	(158,852)	195,816	169,277
2024	53	23.31	1.03000	504,416	20,548	(10,963)	(148,693)	(163,618)	201,690	167,327
2025	54	24.31	1.03000	519,549	21,164	(11,292)	(153,154)	(168,526)	207,741	165,400
2026	55	25.31	1.03000	535,135	21,799	(11,630)	(157,749)	(173,582)	213,973	163,495
2027	56	26.31	1.03000	551,189	22,453	(11,979)	(162,481)	(178,789)	220,392	161,612
2028	57	27.31	1.03000	567,725	23,127	(12,339)	(167,356)	(184,153)	227,004	159,751
2029	58	28.31	1.03000	584,756	23,821	(12,709)	(172,376)	(189,678)	233,814	157,911
2030	59	28.97	1.03000	401,533	16,357	(8,727)	(118,365)	(130,245)	160,552	104,774
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$10,956,603</b>	<b>\$446,327</b>	<b>(\$237,030)</b>	<b>(\$3,230,281)</b>	<b>(\$3,554,501)</b>	<b>\$4,381,118</b>	<b>\$3,935,594</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	0.000%	48.039%	3.463%	Varies

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. MICHAEL BOCCARDI**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401(k)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	30	0.31	\$1,749	\$5,050	\$0	(\$3,266)	\$3,532	\$3,532
2002	31	1.31	5,930	7,657	0	(6,527)	7,060	7,060
2003	32	2.31	6,345	8,704	0	(7,230)	7,820	7,820
2004	33	3.31	6,776	9,429	0	(7,785)	8,421	8,421
2005	34	4.31	7,223	10,155	0	(8,348)	9,030	9,030
2006	35	5.31	7,684	10,880	0	(8,918)	9,646	9,646
2007	36	6.31	8,160	11,098	0	(9,251)	10,006	10,006
2008	37	7.31	8,648	11,320	0	(9,592)	10,375	10,375
2009	38	8.31	9,148	11,546	0	(9,941)	10,753	10,753
2010	39	9.31	9,658	11,777	0	(10,297)	11,138	11,138
2011	40	10.31	10,178	12,012	0	(10,660)	11,530	11,530
2012	41	11.31	10,705	12,253	0	(11,029)	11,929	11,929
2013	42	12.31	11,238	12,498	0	(11,402)	12,333	12,333
2014	43	13.31	11,775	12,748	0	(11,781)	12,742	12,742
2015	44	14.31	12,314	13,003	0	(12,162)	13,155	13,155
2016	45	15.31	12,854	13,263	0	(12,546)	13,570	13,570
2017	46	16.31	13,391	13,528	0	(12,932)	13,987	13,987
2018	47	17.31	13,924	13,799	0	(13,318)	14,405	14,405
2019	48	18.31	14,452	14,074	0	(13,704)	14,822	14,822
2020	49	19.31	14,970	14,356	0	(14,088)	15,238	14,903
2021	50	20.31	15,478	14,643	0	(14,470)	15,651	14,690
2022	51	21.31	15,972	14,936	0	(14,848)	16,060	14,467
2023	52	22.31	16,451	15,235	0	(15,222)	16,464	14,233
2024	53	23.31	16,945	15,539	0	(15,605)	16,879	14,003
2025	54	24.31	17,453	15,850	0	(15,999)	17,305	13,778
2026	55	25.31	17,977	16,167	0	(16,403)	17,741	13,556
2027	56	26.31	18,516	16,491	0	(16,817)	18,190	13,338
2028	57	27.31	19,072	16,820	0	(17,242)	18,650	13,124
2029	58	28.31	19,644	17,157	0	(17,679)	19,122	12,914
2030	59	28.97	13,489	17,500	0	(14,887)	16,102	10,508
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$368,118</b>	<b>\$389,486</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$363,948)</b>	<b>\$393,656</b>	<b>\$355,769</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. MICHAEL BOCCARDI**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	30	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	31	1.31			0	0
2003	32	2.31			0	0
2004	33	3.31			0	0
2005	34	4.31			0	0
2006	35	5.31			0	0
2007	36	6.31			0	0
2008	37	7.31			0	0
2009	38	8.31			0	0
2010	39	9.31			0	0
2011	40	10.31			0	0
2012	41	11.31			0	0
2013	42	12.31			0	0
2014	43	13.31			0	0
2015	44	14.31			0	0
2016	45	15.31			0	0
2017	46	16.31			0	0
2018	47	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-24**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. Alejandro Cordero**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 5, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	4.2%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. ALEJANDRO CORDERO**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$750,380
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	71,818
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$822,198</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
29,217	3.0%	10.460%	3,026	9.12-73.55%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. ALEJANDRO CORDERO**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	41	0.31	1.00000	\$8,959	\$928	\$0	(\$937)	(\$732)	\$8,218	\$8,218
2002	42	1.31	1.04979	30,671	3,283	(912)	(3,112)	(2,431)	27,500	27,500
2003	43	2.31	1.04779	32,137	3,702	(963)	(3,261)	(2,547)	29,069	29,069
2004	44	3.31	1.04579	33,609	3,999	(1,010)	(3,410)	(2,663)	30,524	30,524
2005	45	4.31	1.04380	35,081	4,312	(1,058)	(3,559)	(2,780)	31,995	31,995
2006	46	5.31	1.04182	36,548	4,639	(1,106)	(3,708)	(2,896)	33,476	33,476
2007	47	6.31	1.03984	38,004	4,984	(1,155)	(3,856)	(24,276)	13,701	13,701
2008	48	7.31	1.03786	39,442	5,341	(1,203)	(4,002)	(25,195)	14,384	14,384
2009	49	8.31	1.03588	40,858	5,715	(1,251)	(4,146)	(26,099)	15,077	15,077
2010	50	9.31	1.03391	42,243	6,104	(1,299)	(4,286)	(26,984)	15,778	15,778
2011	51	10.31	1.03194	43,593	6,506	(1,346)	(4,423)	(27,846)	16,484	16,484
2012	52	11.31	1.03000	44,900	6,922	(1,392)	(4,556)	(28,681)	17,193	17,193
2013	53	12.31	1.03000	46,247	7,351	(1,440)	(4,692)	(29,542)	17,924	17,924
2014	54	13.31	1.03000	47,635	7,790	(1,489)	(4,833)	(30,428)	18,675	18,675
2015	55	14.31	1.03000	49,064	8,241	(1,539)	(4,978)	(31,341)	19,446	19,446
2016	56	15.31	1.03000	50,536	8,701	(1,591)	(5,127)	(32,281)	20,236	20,236
2017	57	16.31	1.03000	52,052	9,168	(1,644)	(5,281)	(33,250)	21,044	21,044
2018	58	17.31	1.03000	53,613	9,642	(1,699)	(5,440)	(34,247)	21,869	21,869
2019	59	18.31	1.03000	55,222	10,123	(1,755)	(5,603)	(35,274)	22,712	22,712
2020	60	19.31	1.03000	56,878	10,607	(1,813)	(5,771)	(36,333)	23,569	23,051
2021	61	20.31	1.03000	58,585	11,092	(1,872)	(5,944)	(37,423)	24,438	22,938
2022	62	21.31	1.03000	60,342	11,578	(1,932)	(6,122)	(38,545)	25,321	22,808
2023	63	22.31	1.03000	62,153	12,062	(1,994)	(6,306)	(39,702)	26,213	22,661
2024	64	23.31	1.03000	64,017	12,542	(2,057)	(6,495)	(40,893)	27,114	22,495
2025	65	24.31	1.03000	65,938	13,017	(2,121)	(6,690)	(42,120)	28,024	22,312
2026	66	25.31	1.03000	67,916	13,486	(2,187)	(6,891)	(43,383)	28,941	22,114
2027	67	26.31	1.03000	69,953	13,943	(2,254)	(7,098)	(44,685)	29,860	21,897
2028	68	27.31	1.03000	72,052	14,389	(2,322)	(7,311)	(46,025)	30,783	21,663
2029	69	28.31	1.03000	74,213	14,820	(2,392)	(7,530)	(47,406)	31,706	21,413
2030	70	29.31	1.03000	76,440	15,262	(2,463)	(7,756)	(48,828)	32,655	21,165
2031	71	30.31	1.03000	78,733	15,722	(2,537)	(7,988)	(50,293)	33,636	20,922
2032	72	31.31	1.03000	81,095	16,193	(2,613)	(8,228)	(51,802)	34,645	20,681
2033	73	32.31	1.03000	83,528	16,680	(2,692)	(8,475)	(53,356)	35,685	20,444
2034	74	33.31	1.03000	86,034	17,179	(2,772)	(8,729)	(54,956)	36,755	20,208
2035	75	34.31	1.03000	88,615	17,694	(2,856)	(8,991)	(56,605)	37,857	19,975
2036	76	34.72	1.03000	38,030	7,595	(1,226)	(3,859)	(24,292)	16,248	8,326
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$1,964,933</b>	<b>\$351,310</b>	<b>(\$61,953)</b>	<b>(\$199,394)</b>	<b>(\$1,156,138)</b>	<b>\$898,758</b>	<b>\$750,380</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	10.460%	9.12-73.55%	0.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS****MR. ALEJANDRO CORDERO**

SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION	401 (K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2041	81	40.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2042	82	41.31	6,484	0	(678)	(4,270)	1,536	608
2043	83	42.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	6,997
2044	84	43.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	6,715
2045	85	44.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	6,444
2046	86	45.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	6,185
2047	87	46.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	5,935
2048	88	47.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	5,696
2049	89	48.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	5,467
2050	90	49.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	5,246
2051	91	50.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	5,035
2052	92	51.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	4,832
2053	93	52.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	4,637
2054	94	53.31	77,808	0	(8,139)	(51,239)	18,430	4,450
2055	95	54.14	64,840	0	(6,782)	(42,699)	15,358	3,571
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$1,005,020</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$105,125)</b>	<b>(\$661,840)</b>	<b>\$238,055</b>	<b>\$71,818</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**  
**MR. ALEJANDRO CORDERO**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	41	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	42	1.31			0	0
2003	43	2.31			0	0
2004	44	3.31			0	0
2005	45	4.31			0	0
2006	46	5.31			0	0
2007	47	6.31			0	0
2008	48	7.31			0	0
2009	49	8.31			0	0
2010	50	9.31			0	0
2011	51	10.31			0	0
2012	52	11.31			0	0
2013	53	12.31			0	0
2014	54	13.31			0	0
2015	55	14.31			0	0
2016	56	15.31			0	0
2017	57	16.31			0	0
2018	58	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>



# **Exhibit B-25**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mr. James Audiffred**

December 14, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 3, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile

VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MR. JAMES AUDIFFRED**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,751,366
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	247,911
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	213,032
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,212,310</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
45,584	3.0%	14.720%	5,797	6.680%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MR. JAMES AUDIFFRED**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE-SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	39	0.31	1.00000	\$13,978	\$1,924	\$0	(\$2,058)	(\$1,779)	\$12,065	\$12,065
2002	40	1.31	1.05379	48,037	6,595	(1,398)	(6,859)	(5,930)	40,445	40,445
2003	41	2.31	1.05179	50,524	6,949	(1,470)	(7,214)	(6,237)	42,551	42,551
2004	42	3.31	1.04979	53,040	7,280	(1,543)	(7,573)	(6,548)	44,656	44,656
2005	43	4.31	1.04779	55,574	7,615	(1,617)	(7,935)	(6,861)	46,776	46,776
2006	44	5.31	1.04579	58,119	7,950	(1,690)	(8,298)	(7,175)	48,905	48,905
2007	45	6.31	1.04380	60,665	8,287	(1,764)	(8,662)	(7,489)	51,037	51,037
2008	46	7.31	1.04182	63,202	8,623	(1,838)	(9,024)	(7,803)	53,161	53,161
2009	47	8.31	1.03984	65,720	8,958	(1,911)	(9,384)	(3,632)	59,752	59,752
2010	48	9.31	1.03786	68,208	9,290	(1,983)	(9,739)	(3,769)	62,007	62,007
2011	49	10.31	1.03588	70,655	9,618	(2,054)	(10,088)	(3,904)	64,227	64,227
2012	50	11.31	1.03391	73,051	9,940	(2,123)	(10,430)	(4,037)	66,401	66,401
2013	51	12.31	1.03194	75,384	10,256	(2,191)	(10,764)	(4,166)	68,520	68,520
2014	52	13.31	1.03000	77,646	10,565	(2,257)	(11,087)	(4,291)	70,577	70,577
2015	53	14.31	1.03000	79,975	10,881	(2,324)	(11,419)	(4,419)	72,694	72,694
2016	54	15.31	1.03000	82,374	11,207	(2,394)	(11,762)	(4,552)	74,874	74,874
2017	55	16.31	1.03000	84,846	11,545	(2,466)	(12,115)	(4,688)	77,121	77,121
2018	56	17.31	1.03000	87,391	11,890	(2,540)	(12,478)	(4,829)	79,434	79,434
2019	57	18.31	1.03000	90,013	12,246	(2,616)	(12,852)	(4,974)	81,816	81,816
2020	58	19.31	1.03000	92,713	12,614	(2,695)	(13,238)	(5,123)	84,272	82,548
2021	59	20.31	1.03000	95,495	12,994	(2,776)	(13,635)	(5,277)	86,801	81,834
2022	60	21.31	1.03000	98,359	13,382	(2,859)	(14,044)	(5,435)	89,404	81,124
2023	61	22.31	1.03000	101,310	13,784	(2,945)	(14,465)	(5,598)	92,086	80,422
2024	62	23.31	1.03000	104,349	14,196	(3,033)	(14,899)	(5,766)	94,847	79,724
2025	63	24.31	1.03000	107,480	14,623	(3,124)	(15,346)	(5,939)	97,693	79,034
2026	64	25.31	1.03000	110,704	15,062	(3,218)	(15,807)	(6,117)	100,625	78,350
2027	65	26.22	1.03000	104,524	14,220	(3,038)	(14,924)	(5,776)	95,006	71,311
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,073,336</b>	<b>\$282,497</b>	<b>(\$59,865)</b>	<b>(\$296,101)</b>	<b>(\$142,114)</b>	<b>\$1,857,753</b>	<b>\$1,751,366</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	6.680%	0.000%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MR. JAMES AUDIFFRED**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	VESTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	39	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	40	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	41	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	42	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	43	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	44	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	45	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	46	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	47	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	48	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	49	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	50	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	51	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	52	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	53	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	54	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	55	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	56	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	57	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	58	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	59	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	60	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	61	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	62	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	63	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	64	25.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2027	65	26.31	4,251	(687)	(770)	(187)	2,608	1,954
2028	66	27.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	22,569
2029	67	28.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	21,722
2030	68	29.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	20,906
2031	69	30.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	20,122
2032	70	31.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	19,366
2033	71	32.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	18,639
2034	72	33.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	17,940
2035	73	34.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	17,266
2036	74	35.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	16,618
2037	75	36.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	15,995
2038	76	37.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	15,394
2039	77	38.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	14,816
2040	78	39.31	51,012	(8,244)	(9,238)	(2,240)	31,290	14,260
2041	79	40.06	38,259	(6,183)	(6,928)	(1,680)	23,468	10,343
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$705,666</b>	<b>(\$114,042)</b>	<b>(\$127,791)</b>	<b>(\$30,984)</b>	<b>\$432,849</b>	<b>\$247,911</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MR. JAMES AUDIFFRED**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	39	0.31	\$2,546	\$431	\$2,977	\$2,977
2002	40	1.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2003	41	2.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2004	42	3.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2005	43	4.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2006	44	5.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2007	45	6.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2008	46	7.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2009	47	8.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2010	48	9.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2011	49	10.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2012	50	11.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2013	51	12.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2014	52	13.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2015	53	14.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2016	54	15.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2017	55	16.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2018	56	17.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2019	57	18.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,708
2020	58	19.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,509
2021	59	20.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	9,153
2022	60	21.31	8,304	1,404	9,708	8,809
2023	61	22.23	7,668	1,296	8,964	7,840
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$184,598</b>	<b>\$31,211</b>	<b>\$215,809</b>	<b>\$213,032</b>

# **Exhibit B-26**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Donna M. Clarke**

December 15, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 24, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

**EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES**  
**MRS. DONNA M. CLARKE**

	<b>PRESENT VALUE</b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$927,448
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	122,593
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,050,041</b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
67,672	3.0%	17.270%	2,906	17.81-61.73%

**EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS**  
**MRS. DONNA M. CLARKE**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	40	0.31	1.00000	\$20,751	\$891	\$0	(\$3,584)	(\$3,058)	\$15,000	\$15,000
2002	41	1.31	1.05179	71,177	3,056	(1,842)	(11,923)	(10,174)	50,293	50,293
2003	42	2.31	1.04979	74,720	3,208	(1,934)	(12,517)	(10,681)	52,797	52,797
2004	43	3.31	1.04779	78,291	3,362	(2,027)	(13,115)	(11,191)	55,320	55,320
2005	44	4.31	1.04579	81,876	3,516	(2,119)	(13,716)	(11,703)	57,853	57,853
2006	45	5.31	1.04380	85,463	3,670	(2,212)	(14,317)	(12,216)	60,387	60,387
2007	46	6.31	1.04182	89,037	3,823	(2,305)	(14,915)	(12,716)	62,917	62,917
2008	47	7.31	1.03984	92,584	3,975	(2,396)	(15,510)	(13,216)	65,448	65,448
2009	48	8.31	1.03786	96,088	4,126	(2,487)	(16,097)	(13,716)	67,979	67,979
2010	49	9.31	1.03588	99,536	4,274	(2,576)	(16,674)	(14,216)	70,510	70,510
2011	50	10.31	1.03391	102,912	4,419	(2,664)	(17,240)	(14,716)	73,041	73,041
2012	51	11.31	1.03194	106,199	4,560	(2,749)	(17,790)	(15,216)	75,572	75,572
2013	52	12.31	1.03000	109,385	4,697	(2,831)	(18,324)	(15,716)	78,103	78,103
2014	53	13.31	1.03000	112,666	4,838	(2,916)	(18,874)	(16,216)	80,634	80,634
2015	54	14.31	1.03000	116,046	4,983	(3,004)	(19,440)	(16,716)	83,165	83,165
2016	55	15.31	1.03000	119,528	5,132	(3,094)	(20,023)	(17,216)	85,696	85,696
2017	56	16.31	1.03000	123,114	5,286	(3,187)	(20,624)	(17,716)	88,227	88,227
2018	57	17.31	1.03000	126,807	5,445	(3,282)	(21,243)	(18,216)	90,758	90,758
2019	58	18.31	1.03000	130,611	5,608	(3,381)	(21,880)	(18,716)	93,289	93,289
2020	59	19.31	1.03000	134,529	5,776	(3,482)	(22,536)	(19,216)	95,820	95,820
2021	60	20.31	1.03000	138,565	5,950	(3,587)	(23,212)	(19,716)	98,351	98,351
2022	61	21.14	1.03000	118,936	5,107	(3,079)	(19,924)	(15,917)	82,123	82,123
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$2,228,821</b>	<b>\$95,700</b>	<b>(\$57,155)</b>	<b>(\$373,477)</b>	<b>(\$958,879)</b>	<b>\$935,010</b>	<b>\$927,448</b>

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	17.270%	17.81-61.73%	0.852%	0.000%

**EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS**  
**MRS. DONNA M. CLARKE**  
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIB.	PROJECTED PENSION	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	40	0.31	\$177	\$0	\$0	(\$31)	\$145	\$145
2002	41	1.31	606	0	0	(108)	498	498
2003	42	2.31	618	0	0	(110)	508	508
2004	43	3.31	647	0	0	(115)	532	532
2005	44	4.31	677	0	0	(121)	556	556
2006	45	5.31	706	0	0	(126)	581	581
2007	46	6.31	736	0	0	(454)	282	282
2008	47	7.31	765	0	0	(472)	293	293
2009	48	8.31	794	0	0	(490)	304	304
2010	49	9.31	823	0	0	(508)	315	315
2011	50	10.31	851	0	0	(525)	326	326
2012	51	11.31	878	0	0	(542)	336	336
2013	52	12.31	904	0	0	(558)	346	346
2014	53	13.31	931	0	0	(575)	356	356
2015	54	14.31	959	0	0	(592)	367	367
2016	55	15.31	988	0	0	(610)	378	378
2017	56	16.31	1,018	0	0	(628)	389	389
2018	57	17.31	1,048	0	0	(647)	401	401
2019	58	18.31	1,080	0	0	(666)	413	413
2020	59	19.31	1,112	0	0	(686)	426	417
2021	60	20.31	1,145	0	0	(707)	438	413
2022	61	21.31	983	0	0	(607)	376	341
2023	62	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	63	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	64	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	65	25.31	0	7,272	(1,256)	(3,714)	2,302	1,793
2027	66	26.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	10,353
2028	67	27.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	9,964
2029	68	28.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	9,590
2030	69	29.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	9,230
2031	70	30.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	8,884
2032	71	31.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	8,550
2033	72	32.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	8,229
2034	73	33.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	7,920
2035	74	34.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	7,623
2036	75	35.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	7,337
2037	76	36.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	7,061
2038	77	37.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	6,796
2039	78	38.31	0	43,632	(7,535)	(22,282)	13,814	6,541
2040	79	38.97	0	29,088	(5,023)	(14,855)	9,210	4,224
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$18,446</b>	<b>\$603,576</b>	<b>(\$104,238)</b>	<b>(\$318,118)</b>	<b>\$199,666</b>	<b>\$122,593</b>

**EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES****MRS. DONNA M. CLARKE**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	40	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	41	1.31			0	0
2003	42	2.31			0	0
2004	43	3.31			0	0
2005	44	4.31			0	0
2006	45	5.31			0	0
2007	46	6.31			0	0
2008	47	7.31			0	0
2009	48	8.31			0	0
2010	49	9.31			0	0
2011	50	10.31			0	0
2012	51	11.31			0	0
2013	52	12.31			0	0
2014	53	13.31			0	0
2015	54	14.31			0	0
2016	55	15.31			0	0
2017	56	16.31			0	0
2018	57	17.31			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>

# **Exhibit B-27**

**John E. Beauzile**

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: [jeb2235@columbia.edu](mailto:jeb2235@columbia.edu)

**Jerry S. Goldman**

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of  
The Estate of **Mrs. Digna Alexandra Rivera Costanza**

January 4, 2020

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11<sup>th</sup> Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **Frankenfeld Associates (FA)** dated **July 2002**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **FA's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **FA** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **FA's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



<b>Valuation Date</b>	01-Jan-20
<b>Discount Rate</b>	4.2%

**Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages**  
**Mrs. Digna Alexandra Rivera Costanza**

	<b><u>Present Value</u></b>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,741,233
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	193,922
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
<b>Total</b>	<b><u><u>\$1,935,156</u></u></b>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
32,000	3.0%	12.960%	2,400	26.700%

**Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings**  
**Mrs. Digna Alexandra Rivera Costanza**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	25	0.31	1.00000	\$9,812	\$736	\$0	(\$1,272)	(\$2,280)	\$6,996	\$6,996
2002	26	1.31	1.08227	34,633	2,448	(968)	(4,354)	(7,807)	23,952	23,952
2003	27	2.31	1.08021	37,411	2,497	(1,042)	(4,703)	(8,433)	25,729	25,729
2004	28	3.31	1.07816	40,335	2,547	(1,120)	(5,071)	(9,092)	27,599	27,599
2005	29	4.31	1.07611	43,404	2,598	(1,201)	(5,456)	(9,784)	29,560	29,560
2006	30	5.31	1.07406	46,619	2,650	(1,286)	(5,861)	(10,509)	31,612	31,612
2007	31	6.31	1.07201	49,976	2,703	(1,376)	(6,283)	(11,266)	33,755	33,755
2008	32	7.31	1.06997	53,473	2,757	(1,468)	(6,722)	(12,054)	35,985	35,985
2009	33	8.31	1.06794	57,106	2,812	(1,565)	(7,179)	(12,873)	38,301	38,301
2010	34	9.31	1.06591	60,869	2,868	(1,664)	(7,652)	(13,721)	40,700	40,700
2011	35	10.31	1.06388	64,757	2,926	(1,767)	(8,141)	(14,598)	43,177	43,177
2012	36	11.31	1.06185	68,763	2,984	(1,873)	(8,644)	(15,501)	45,728	45,728
2013	37	12.31	1.05983	72,877	3,044	(1,982)	(9,161)	(16,428)	48,348	48,348
2014	38	13.31	1.05781	77,090	3,105	(2,094)	(9,691)	(17,378)	51,032	51,032
2015	39	14.31	1.05580	81,392	3,167	(2,208)	(10,232)	(18,348)	53,771	53,771
2016	40	15.31	1.05379	85,770	3,230	(2,324)	(10,782)	(19,335)	56,559	56,559
2017	41	16.31	1.05179	90,212	3,295	(2,442)	(11,341)	(20,336)	59,388	59,388
2018	42	17.31	1.04979	94,703	3,361	(2,561)	(11,905)	(21,348)	62,249	62,249
2019	43	18.31	1.04779	99,229	3,428	(2,681)	(12,474)	(22,369)	65,133	65,133
2020	44	19.31	1.04579	103,773	3,496	(2,801)	(13,046)	(23,393)	68,030	66,535
2021	45	20.31	1.04380	108,319	3,566	(2,922)	(13,617)	(24,418)	70,929	66,574
2022	46	21.31	1.04182	112,848	3,638	(3,042)	(14,186)	(25,439)	73,819	66,494
2023	47	22.31	1.03984	117,344	3,710	(3,161)	(14,752)	(26,452)	76,689	66,296
2024	48	23.31	1.03786	121,786	3,785	(3,279)	(15,310)	(27,454)	79,528	65,978
2025	49	24.31	1.03588	126,156	3,860	(3,395)	(15,859)	(28,439)	82,323	65,544
2026	50	25.31	1.03391	130,434	3,937	(3,509)	(16,397)	(29,403)	85,062	64,996
2027	51	26.31	1.03194	134,600	4,016	(3,620)	(16,921)	(30,342)	87,734	64,335
2028	52	27.31	1.03000	138,638	4,097	(3,727)	(17,428)	(31,253)	90,327	63,566
2029	53	28.31	1.03000	142,797	4,178	(3,838)	(17,951)	(32,190)	92,997	62,807
2030	54	29.31	1.03000	147,081	4,262	(3,952)	(18,490)	(33,156)	95,746	62,058
2031	55	30.31	1.03000	151,494	4,347	(4,069)	(19,045)	(34,150)	98,577	61,317
2032	56	31.31	1.03000	156,039	4,434	(4,190)	(19,616)	(35,175)	101,492	60,586
2033	57	32.31	1.03000	160,720	4,523	(4,315)	(20,204)	(36,230)	104,493	59,863
2034	58	33.31	1.03000	165,541	4,613	(4,443)	(20,811)	(37,317)	107,584	59,150
2035	59	33.40	1.03000	15,919	439	(427)	(2,001)	(3,588)	10,341	5,559
<b>Total</b>				<b>\$3,201,920</b>	<b>\$114,056</b>	<b>(\$86,311)</b>	<b>(\$402,558)</b>	<b>(\$721,861)</b>	<b>\$2,105,246</b>	<b>\$1,741,233</b>



Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	12.960%	26.700%	8.470%	0.000%

**Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits**  
**Mrs. Digna Alexandra Rivera Costanza**  
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	401(k)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	25	0.31	\$831	\$0	\$0	(\$45)	\$786	\$786
2002	26	1.31	2,845	0	0	(154)	2,691	2,691
2003	27	2.31	3,074	0	0	(167)	2,907	2,907
2004	28	3.31	3,314	0	0	(180)	3,134	3,134
2005	29	4.31	3,566	0	0	(193)	3,373	3,373
2006	30	5.31	3,830	0	0	(208)	3,623	3,623
2007	31	6.31	4,106	0	0	(222)	3,883	3,883
2008	32	7.31	4,393	0	0	(238)	4,155	4,155
2009	33	8.31	4,692	0	0	(254)	4,438	4,438
2010	34	9.31	5,001	0	0	(271)	4,730	4,730
2011	35	10.31	5,320	0	0	(355)	4,965	4,965
2012	36	11.31	5,649	0	0	(377)	5,272	5,272
2013	37	12.31	5,987	0	0	(521)	5,466	5,466
2014	38	13.31	6,334	0	0	(551)	5,782	5,782
2015	39	14.31	6,687	0	0	(582)	6,105	6,105
2016	40	15.31	7,047	0	0	(880)	6,167	6,167
2017	41	16.31	7,412	0	0	(925)	6,486	6,486
2018	42	17.31	7,781	0	0	(972)	6,809	6,809
2019	43	18.31	8,153	0	0	(1,018)	7,135	7,135
2020	44	19.31	8,526	0	0	(1,065)	7,461	7,297
2021	45	20.31	8,899	0	0	(1,111)	7,788	7,310
2022	46	21.31	9,272	0	0	(1,158)	8,114	7,309
2023	47	22.31	9,641	0	0	(1,204)	8,437	7,294
2024	48	23.31	10,006	0	0	(1,249)	8,756	7,265
2025	49	24.31	10,365	0	0	(1,294)	9,071	7,222
2026	50	25.31	10,716	0	0	(1,338)	9,378	7,166
2027	51	26.31	11,059	0	0	(1,381)	9,678	7,097
2028	52	27.31	11,390	0	0	(1,422)	9,968	7,015
2029	53	28.31	11,732	0	0	(1,465)	10,267	6,934
2030	54	29.31	12,084	0	0	(1,509)	10,575	6,854
2031	55	30.31	12,447	0	0	(1,554)	10,892	6,775
2032	56	31.31	12,820	0	0	(1,601)	11,219	6,697
2033	57	32.31	13,205	0	0	(1,649)	11,556	6,620
2034	58	33.31	13,601	0	0	(1,698)	11,902	6,544
2035	59	33.40	1,308	0	0	(163)	1,145	615
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$263,091</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>(\$28,975)</b>	<b>\$234,117</b>	<b>\$193,922</b>

**Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**  
**Mrs. Digna Alexandra Rivera Costanza**

<b>Year</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Time Frame</b>	<b>Household Services</b>	<b>Care Services</b>	<b>Total Services</b>	<b>Present Value</b>
2001	25	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	26	1.31			0	0
2003	27	2.31			0	0
2004	28	3.31			0	0
2005	29	4.31			0	0
2006	30	5.31			0	0
2007	31	6.31			0	0
2008	32	7.31			0	0
2009	33	8.31			0	0
2010	34	9.31			0	0
2011	35	10.31			0	0
2012	36	11.31			0	0
2013	37	12.31			0	0
2014	38	13.31			0	0
2015	39	14.31			0	0
2016	40	15.31			0	0
2017	41	16.31			0	0
2018	42	17.31			0	0
2019	43	18.31			0	0
2020	44	19.31			0	0
2021	45	20.31			0	0
2022	46	21.31			0	0
2023	47	22.31			0	0
2024	48	23.31			0	0
2025	49	24.31			0	0
2026	50	25.31			0	0
2027	51	26.31			0	0
2028	52	27.31			0	0
2029	53	28.31			0	0
2030	54	29.31			0	0
2031	55	30.31			0	0
2032	56	31.31			0	0
2033	57	32.31			0	0
2034	58	33.31			0	0
2035	59	34.31			0	0
2036	60	35.06			0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>